



NEVADA HISTORICAL SOCIETY QUARTERLY

EDITORIAL BOARD

Eugene Moehring, Chairman, University of Nevada, Las Vegas Marie Boutté, University of Nevada, Reno Robert Davenport, University of Nevada, Las Vegas Doris Dwyer, Western Nevada Community College Jerome E. Edwards, University of Nevada, Reno Candace C. Kant, Community College of Southern Nevada Guy Louis Rocha, Nevada State Library and Archives Willard H. Rollings, University of Nevada, Las Vegas Hal K. Rothman, University of Nevada, Las Vegas

The *Nevada Historical Society Quarterly* solicits contributions of scholarly or popular interest dealing with the following subjects: the general (e.g., the political, social, economic, constitutional) or the natural history of Nevada and the Great Basin; the literature, languages, anthropology, and archaeology of these areas; reprints of historic documents; reviews and essays concerning the historical literature of Nevada, the Great Basin, and the West.

Prospective authors should send their work to The Editor, *Nevada Historical Society Quarterly*, 1650 N. Virginia St., Reno, Nevada 89503. Papers should be typed double-spaced and sent in duplicate. All manuscripts, whether articles, edited documents, or essays, should conform to the most recent edition of the University of Chicago Press *Manual of Style*. Footnotes should be typed double-spaced on separate pages and numbered consecutively. Correspondence concerning articles and essays is welcomed, and should be addressed to The Editor. © Copyright Nevada Historical Society, 1998.

The Nevada Historical Society Quarterly (ISSN 0047-9462) is published quarterly by the Nevada Historical Society. The Quarterly is sent to all members of the Society. Membership dues are: Student, \$15; Senior Citizen without Quarterly, \$15; Regular, \$25; Family, \$35; Sustaining, \$50; Contributing, \$100; Departmental Fellow, \$250; Patron, \$500; Benefactor, \$1,000. Membership applications and dues should be sent to the Director, Nevada Historical Society, 1650 N. Virginia St., Reno, NV 89503. Periodicals postage paid at Reno, Nevada and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Nevada Historical Society Quarterly, 1650 N. Virginia St., Reno, Nevada 89503.

Nevada Historical Society Quarterly

William D. Rowley Editor-in-Chief

Jerome E. Edwards	Juliet S. Pierson
Book Review Editor	ManuscriptEditor

Volume 41

Spring 1998

Number 1

Contents

- 3 And Who Shall Have the Children? The Indian Slave Trade in the Southern Great Basin, 1800–1865 STEPHEN P. VAN HOAK
- 26 The Making of Mark Twain BRIAN SCOT HAGEN
- 40 From Great Britain to the Great Basin Robert Fulstone and Early Carson City **PETER B. MIRES**
- 51 Notes and Documents A Recently Discovered Comstock Letter of Mark Twain LAWRENCE I. BERKOVE

Front Cover: Virginia City, 1865. (Nevada Historical Society)

Book Reviews

- 59 Comstock Women: The Making of a Mining Community. Edited by Ronald M. James and Elizabeth Raymond. (Reno: University Press, 1998, 260 pp.). reviewed by Susan Armitage
- 61 *America's Historic Trails*. By J. Kingston Pierce with Tom Bodett. (San Francisco: KQED Books, 1997, x + 260 pp., foreword, photographs, illustrations, maps, bibliography, index). reviewed by Cyd McMullen
- 62 The Greatest Nation of the Earth: Republican Economic Policies During the Civil War. By Heather Cox Richardson. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1997, + viii, 342 pp. including notes and index). reviewed by Michael S. Green
- On the Home Front: The Cold War Legacy of the Hanford Nuclear Site.
 By Michele Stenehjem Gerber. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1992, Epilogue, 1997, 334 pp.).
 reviewed by Constandina Titus
- 65 *The Players: The Men Who Made Las Vegas.* Edited by Jack E. Sheehan. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1997, 224 pp., photographs, index). reviewed by Gary E. Elliot

AND WHO SHALL HAVE THE CHILDREN? The Indian Slave Trade in the Southern Great Basin, 1800–1865

Stephen P. Van Hoak

Some of Walker's [Waccara's] band [of Utes] were in the habit of raiding on the Pahutes and low tribes, taking their children prisoners and selling them. Next year when they came up and camped on the Provo bench, they had some Indian children for sale. They offered them to the Mormons, who declined buying. Arapine, Walker's brother, became enraged saying that the Mormons had stopped the Mexicans from buying these children; that they had no right to do so, unless they bought them themselves. Several of us were present when he took one of these children by the heels and dashed its brains out on the hard ground, after which he threw the body towards us, telling us we had no hearts, or we would have bought it and saved its life.

> Daniel W. Jones Utah, 1853¹

For the Southern Paiute and Western Ute inhabitants of the southern Great Basin, contact with Euroamericans initiated extensive cultural transformations. In 1776, Friar Francisco Athanasio Domínguez, a Spanish Franciscan seeking a land route to California, led the first recorded Euroamerican expedition into the Great Basin. Though Domínguez's expedition was unsuccessful in finding a passage to that extensive Spanish province, it did achieve another objective by making contact with both the Western Utes of present-day Utah and the Southern Paiutes of southwestern Utah and southern Nevada. Domínguez's promises to return to these people for the purpose of building settlements and missions did not come to fruition, but the trails into the Great Basin forged by Domínguez and others were followed by New Mexican and American trappers and traders, and eventually by a flood of Mormon settlers hungry for land. Throughout the turbulent post-contact period, the Southern Paiutes and Western Utes sought to adapt to the deluge of Euroamerican influences and settlements washing into their lands. Among the many tragic consequences

Stephen P. Van Hoak is currently a doctoral student in history at the University of Oklahoma. He wishes to thank both Professors Willard Rollings and Hal K. Rothman for reviewing early drafts of this manuscript while Mr. Van Hoak was in the M.A. program in history at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas.

of Euroamerican influence and Indian accommodation was the creation of an Indian slave trade. Differing capacities of the Southern Paiutes and Western Utes to adapt to change resulted in the Utes becoming active slave raiders and traders, with the Paiutes often becoming their victims. By the early 1850s the slave trade was at its peak, involving New Mexicans, Utes, Mormons, and Paiutes, all contending for possession of Paiute children, the preferred target of slavers. Euroamericans were not only the catalysts for this slave trade, but also the agents of its eventual demise.²

Prior to Euroamerican contact, slavery was virtually nonexistent among the Southern Paiutes and Western Utes. Primarily hunting and gathering societies, these tribes had neither cultural nor economic use for slaves. In the arid Great Basin, the resources consumed by slaves would have equaled or exceeded the sparse resources they might have generated, and the nearest potential market for the sale of captives was New Mexico, an area largely unknown to the Paiutes and Utes prior to the Domínguez expedition in 1776. Women and children captured in intertribal conflicts were either killed or integrated into the capturing tribe, while male captives were nearly always killed. But the entry of New Mexicans into the Great Basin beginning in 1776 provided the Western Utes with an alternative to killing or integrating captives.³

Domínguez's trail into the Great Basin was soon followed by New Mexicans seeking trade with the newly discovered natives of the Great Basin. The New Mexican traders who journeyed along the Spanish Trail into Western Ute territory were primarily interested in beaver pelts, but many also traveled there in search of slaves. In 1813 Mauricio Arze and Lagos Garcia led a trading expedition to Utah Lake in central Utah that returned to New Mexico with several Indian captives purchased from the Western Utes. According to the affidavits of the members of this expedition, the Western Utes were accustomed to selling captives to passing New Mexican traders.⁴ This is the first evidence of an Indian slave trade in the Great Basin, and it suggests that Euroamericans created the market for slaves in that region sometime between 1776 and 1813.5 The slave traders usually brought purchased captives back to New Mexico for sale as domestic servants to wealthy landowners.6 Children were highly prized as slaves and the preferred target of traders because of their relative ease of control and assimilation; child captives thus became more valuable to the Western Utes as objects for barter to slave traders for Euroamerican goods than as potential integrated members of the tribe..

In addition to a market for slaves, New Mexicans also introduced guns and horses to the Western Utes, who proved ideally suited to acquire and utilize these items. The home of the Western Utes in the foothills of the Wasatch Mountains provided a generous supply of exploitable food sources, including small and large game, piñon nuts, and numerous edible plants and roots. Utah Lake was the only large freshwater lake in the southern Great Basin, and its numerous feeder streams ensured a stable, year-round supply of fish for the Western



New Mexicans, Utes, Mormons, and Paiutes contended for possession of Paiute children, the preferred target of slavers. (*Nevada Historical Society*)

Utes.⁷ This abundance of food sources supported a population of Utes that was comparatively dense by Great Basin standards, including a large number of warriors. The location of the Western Utes, astride both the east-west Spanish Trail and the north-south trade route used by fur trappers, allowed them access to trade without their ecosystem and grasslands being ravaged by the heavy traffic of the Spanish Trail.⁸ The Utes' excellent access to trade and their surplus of available resources enabled them to trade pelts and food, as well as captives, to Euroamerican traders in exchange for guns and horses. As guns and horses proliferated among the Western Utes, the newly armed and mounted warriors formed predatory raiding bands, primarily hunting buffalo in what is now Utah, Wyoming, and Idaho, and engaging in small-scale horse raids against the Shoshone inhabitants of those regions.⁹ Usually horse raiding and buffalo hunting were profitable ventures and lucrative vocations for the warriors in these bands, and by the 1820s many such bands existed among the Western Utes.¹⁰

In contrast to the Western Utes, the Southern Paiutes were unable to adopt widespread use of guns and horses. Southern Paiute lands were characterized by expansive dry and bleak landscapes dotted with relatively small, fertile areas surrounding springs and rivers. Though the Paiutes were experts at exploiting the scarce resources in their environment, they had few desirable products to trade to the New Mexicans for guns, ammunition, or horses.¹¹ With only scattered large game to hunt and no nearby weaker tribes to raid, the potential economic advantages in acquiring these weapons was severely limited. Effective hunting, raiding, and combat application of guns and horses required a denser population than that of the Southern Paiutes, whose concentration of resources was insufficient to support such a population. Even had they acquired a large quantity of horses, the relatively sparse grasslands in Southern Paiute territory were inadequate to sustain such herds for protracted periods of time.¹² As a result, the few horses the Paiutes acquired were consumed as food, and the few guns they procured quickly fell into disuse as they malfunctioned or were depleted of ammunition.¹³ Lacking a concentrated force of mounted and well-armed warriors, the Paiutes were at a severe military disadvantage to both the Western Utes and the New Mexicans.

In 1830, annual New Mexican caravans, often consisting of hundreds of traders and thousands of animals, began to traverse the Spanish Trail between New Mexico and California.¹⁴ Although most of the New Mexicans in these caravans were legitimate traders, some capitalized on the relative military weakness of the Paiutes to obtain slaves.¹⁵ Many of these slave traders possessed guns and horses that enabled them to strike quickly, overwhelm small groups of unmounted and bow-armed Paiutes, and leave quickly without retaliation. These raids became quite common, as evidenced by an incident involving Edward F. Beale, superintendent of Indian affairs in California, who was traveling west to assume his post in 1853. While in southwestern Utah, a New Mexican accompanying Beale enthusiastically characterized slave hunting for Paiutes as a common and unobjectionable pursuit, and further urged Beale to assist him to "charge [the Paiutes] like hell, kill the *mans*, and maybe catch some of the little boys and *gals*."¹⁶ The New Mexicans usually hunted slaves on the return trip in early spring, when Paiute food supplies were at their lowest and the tribe was most vulnerable.¹⁷

Militarily overmatched and often outnumbered, the Southern Paiutes commonly sought to avoid slave raiders. Individual groups of Southern Paiutes along the Spanish Trail had little collective military or political organization, so coordinated defensive efforts were not feasible.¹⁸ Although adjacent groups of Paiutes may have warned each other of approaching travelers through the use of smoke signals, hiding was usually the Paiutes' only possible defense.¹⁹ Typically they sent away their women and children, while the male warriors hid and observed strangers as they approached. If the travelers were not slavers, the Paiutes were often friendly and well disposed to trade; otherwise they usually remained concealed.²⁰ But many Southern Paiutes were dependent on the water sites of the Spanish Trail, and slave traders aware of that fact were occasionally able to surprise them. Resource-depleted and hungry, confronted with powerful slaving bands often impossible to avoid, many Paiutes were left with only one reasonable option: the peaceful trading of their children to the slave traders.²¹

Nonviolent sale of their children to slave traders had numerous benefits for the Southern Paiutes, especially in the spring, when they often experienced food shortages. Many slave traders were willing to part with a low-quality horse or gun in exchange for a child. To the Paiutes, the horse was food that could possibly save many from starvation, and the guns could be used to hunt stray animals in passing caravans. By trading children peacefully, the Paiutes avoided a one-sided confrontation in which they could lose many more of their number to battle or slavery, while the slave traders eliminated any risk to themselves in such a battle. Faced with this difficult choice, some groups of Pajutes captured and sold children from other Paiute clans rather than surrender their own children.²²

Slavery had a profoundly tragic effect on the families of the Paiute victims, who often watched helplessly as their children were taken hundreds of miles away to permanent servitude in an alien culture.²³ Although parents who resisted were usually killed, some resorted to desperate acts to save their children from slavery. In one instance, a Paiute woman whose infant was seized recaptured the child from its captors. The slave traders pursued and cornered the woman, whereupon she flung the infant over a cliff rather than surrender him again.²⁴ Fear of slave raids was pervasive near the Spanish Trail.²⁵ In 1853, some passing travelers came upon a Paiute village; the Paiute women fled and hid their children, fearing the strangers were slavers. As the travelers entered one of the huts, they noticed a slight movement inside a wicker basket; lifting



The high losses of women often made it difficult for single males to find wives. (*Nevada Historical Society*)



Agriculture and plant gathering likely suffered from the death of women, who were responsible for these activities. (*Nevada Historical Society*)

the lid, they found within "a little naked fellow, his teeth chattering with fear."²⁶ Adult women were also a frequent target of slavers, as illustrated in the following excerpt from the recollection of a member of a trapping/trading expedition in 1841:

Passing on for five further days, two Indian women were found digging roots. They were seized and forced to join us. They wept silently and one of them pointed to her breasts, saying her child would die if she left him, but our men took no heed of her. Next day her milk was streaming from her dugs and she became seriously sad, sobbing wildly and vehemently for her young, and I was bent on conniving at her escape. We also came upon three forsaken grass tents whose natives fled at our approach except two children, a boy and a girl who had no mother, and their father being out hunting the others left them to their fate. The poor motherless things were much frightened and nearly choked from fear . . . But the poor father, where was he and what a hopeless fire he must have lighted on the night of his return to his dark and grassy home.²⁷

Patterns of Paiute social grouping compounded the tragic impact of slave raids. Small Paiute communities were devastated by losses of up to half their women and children, including the entire families of some men, as illustrated above.²⁸ The high losses of women often made it difficult for single males to find wives, and agriculture and plant gathering likely suffered from the death of women, who were responsible for these activities.²⁹ Fortunately, Southern Paiute social organization was very flexible, and many small groups severely victimized by slaving joined neighboring groups.

To the Paiutes, the most feared and dangerous slave raiders were a band of Western Utes led by Waccara, "The Hawk of the Mountains," who augmented horse raiding and buffalo hunting by demanding children from the Paiutes along the Spanish Trail. Waccara and his band were rarely more than a few days away and were intimately familiar with the Paiute lands, so hiding was not an effective defense for the Paiutes in this case. Usually unable either to resist or to evade Waccara's Utes, the Paiutes often received little or no compensation for the children they seized. By modern standards, Waccara and his band were frequently extremely brutal in their treatment of captives, torturing or even killing the uncooperative, either directly or through extreme neglect and starvation; such treatment did not, however, violate Western Ute cultural values or norms that placed minimal value on the lives of captives.³⁰ Waccara's Utes bartered surviving captive children to New Mexican traders or Navajos for guns, ammunition, and occasionally horses, usually receiving far more in trade than the Paiutes had for their own children.³¹

By the 1840s, Waccara and his band were a major military, political, and economic factor in the Great Basin, partially as a result of their success at the slave trade.³² That success was in turn the direct result of their acquisition of guns and horses, which had brought them military dominance over the Southern Paiutes. But beginning in 1847, a new people also armed with guns and horses began to arrive in Utah, seeking a home in the Great Basin and intent on exerting their will over the native inhabitants of the region.

And Who Shall Have the Children?



Waccara, called "The Hawk of the Mountains," led the most feared and dangerous slave raiders, a band of Western Utes who augmented horse raiding and buffalo hunting by demanding children from the Paiutes along the Spanish Trail. (*Utah State Historical Society*)

The members of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, commonly referred to as Mormons, arrived in the Salt Lake Valley with mixed attitudes toward American Indians. Brigham Young, leader of the Mormons, selected Salt Lake Valley for the first settlement as it was the site least likely to provoke hostilities with the natives, although he claimed that his people arrived in Utah ready to "kill all [the Utah Indians] if obliged."33 Of foremost importance to Young and the Mormon leadership was the securing of a safe new home for their people. His intent was not to destroy the Indians but rather, if possible, to bring them "salvation" through assimilation. Central to the views of Young and the Mormon leadership was the belief that the Indians of North America were descendants of a fallen tribe of Israel: the Lamanites. According to The Book of Mormon and Mormon theology, the formula for the redemption of the Lamanites involved the resettlement of Lamanite lands by whites, the teaching to the Indians of their true history as recounted in The Book of Mormon, and the restoration of the "true church" among the Indians. With all this accomplished, the Lamanites would have the curse of their dark skin removed and once again become a "white and delightsome people," assisting the Mormons in preparing for the second coming of Jesus Christ.³⁴ This belief was integral to official Mormon policy toward the American Indians from the 1830s to the 1860s, and became the basis for the Mormon leadership's ethnocentric paternalism in their relations with the Western Utes and Southern Paiutes. Most Mormon settlers, however, were far more concerned with practical matters than with the salvation of the Lamanites. To these settlers, Indians were a hindrance that necessitated forcible removal. Brigham Young initially yielded to pressure by these settlers in sanctioning military engagements, but the cost of these conflicts was high and eventually Young firmly established an Indian-relations policy based upon the principle that it was more economical to "feed rather than fight" the Indians. This appealed to the settlers, many of whom understood the economic value of Young's policy while remaining dubious of the necessity of saving the Lamanites.35

The Western Utes were divided in their views regarding the Mormon settlement. Grouped into different political units in each area of high resource density, the Utes had no political organization at the "tribal" level.³⁶ Although the first Mormon settlement in Utah was in Salt Lake Valley, an area of dispute between the Western Utes and the Shoshoni, subsequent Mormon settlements extended southward into the heart of Western Ute territory. Sowiette, leader of the Uintah Western Utes, whose hunting grounds in the Uintah Basin of northeastern Utah remained untouched by the Mormons, supported Mormon settlement of western and southern Utah. Many of the Western Utes in the path of Mormon settlement were less supportive, however, including Waccara, who twice resolved to attack the fledgling settlements only to be dissuaded by Sowiette's support of the Mormons.³⁷ Unable to oppose both Sowiette and the Mormons, Waccara eventually ceased efforts to dislodge the Mormons and began cultivating their friendship, intent on developing a more dependable source of guns and ammunition and a more convenient market for the sale of his horses and captives.

The Mormons were confronted with Indian slavery almost immediately upon arriving in Salt Lake Valley. In the winter of 1847–48, several Indians of unspecified origin came to the Mormon camp demanding that the Mormons purchase two captive Indian girls from them. The Mormons were reluctant to trade for the captives, especially at the required price of a rifle. But the Indians proceeded to torture and kill one of the girls, whereupon the Mormons immediately purchased the other girl for the specified price.³⁸ Though initially unwilling to purchase captives or to supply arms to the Western Utes, Mormons were often pressured into buying children by Ute threats of violence upon these victims. Several other children were purchased by Mormons during that first winter in Utah to prevent perceived cruelty and neglect of captives, as depicted in the following Mormon account.³⁹

One poor little boy, not more than five years old, an emaciated, motherless, little captive, with scarcely one thin dirty rag between his tender flesh and the chilling frosts of early spring, came night after night, close to our homes and built his lonely little campfire, of the chips hewn from the logs, which the settlers had been using. When the earth beneath the fire became sufficiently warmed, he would carefully remove the coals, and with the patient stoicism of his own race, lie down to sleep. It was apparent to all that he was slowly dying of hunger, cold, and neglect. The children of the whites occasionally divided their scanty morsel with him. But one morning, by the lifeless embers of his little campfire, he lay dead.⁴⁰

Although the Mormons did not purchase this child, they increasingly succumbed to Ute attempts to cultivate their sympathies for such children and the market for captives became increasingly important to Waccara's band.

As a result of Mormon settlement in Utah and other external pressures, Waccara's band began to diminish in number, strength, and influence, increasing their reliance on the slave trade. The thousands of Mormons who flooded into Utah in the 1840s and 1850s armed with guns and horses constituted a powerful new force in the Great Basin. They depleted the supply of game and cleared for settlement and agricultural purpose the grasslands that were vital to Waccara.⁴¹ They also inhibited his efforts to trade with non-Mormons for guns and ammunition. At the same time, Euroamerican diseases such as measles began to ravage Waccara's people, incapacitating many of his warriors.⁴² The raiding and hunting effectiveness of Waccara's band was minimal without a significant number of healthy warriors and frequent replenishment of guns, ammunition, and horses.⁴³ By 1850, the buffalo had disappeared from within effective range of Waccara's band, the fur trade had collapsed, and horse raiding had become more dangerous and uncertain as American troops moved to California and New Mexico following the Mexican War in 1846.44 When his raids began to fail, Waccara and his band were forced to depend upon the sale of Paiute children to acquire much needed guns, ammunition, and horses.⁴⁵ To Waccara and his warriors, the hunting-and-gathering subsistence used by the Western Utes, before the horse was not appealing, and in any case it was impractical after Mormon sett1ement.⁴⁶ New Mexican caravans ceased their yearly trading ventures over the Spanish Trail in 1844, but small groups of traders continued to traffic along the Spanish Trail. With increasing frequency, Waccara directed quick raids on the nearby Paiute tribes and bartered captives to passing traders or to Mormons for the products he and his people needed.

Mormon positions on slavery as an institution were varied. African American slaves were brought into Utah by Mormons, although not in great numbers. The small scale farming practiced by Mormons was not conducive to slave labor, and Mormon doctrines of individual hard work and community assistance for the common good were inconsistent with slavery. But slavery was legally allowed until 1862 in all territories, including Utah, and though Brigham Young's statements on the issue of slavery are conflicting, African American slavery was tolerated in Utah. In this case, Mormon theology dictated policy– African Americans were "the cursed seed of Canaan and should serve the sons of Abraham."⁴⁷ But "Lamanites," though also cursed with dark skin, were not relegated to servitude by Mormon doctrine. Ultimately, the Mormon position on Indian captivity was dictated by a combination of pragmatic concerns and theology.

The early reluctance of Mormons to purchase Indian captives changed to their willing and active participation in the slave trade by 1850. Brigham Young greatly coveted friendship with the still influential and powerful Waccara. Young's desire to assimilate and "save" the Lamanites, as well as to appease Waccara, induced him to embrace the concept of Mormon "adoption" of Paiute children. He advised his people "to buy up the Lamanite children as fast as they could, and educate them and teach them the gospel so that many generations would not pass err they should become a white and delightsome people."48 Waccara was given a traveling paper by a Mormon church official that certified him as a friend of the Mormons, and indicated Waccara's intent "to trade horses, Buckskins, and Piede [Paiute] children-we hope them success and prosperity and good bargains."49 In addition to the Mormon–Ute traffic in captives, some Paiute groups raided other Paiutes for children and bartered the captives to Mormons, usually for food.⁵⁰ The Paiutes also occasionally sold or gave their own children to the Mormons - not only would the Paiutes receive food in exchange for the child, but the child would also be well fed in the new home and allowed visitation by the Paiute family. Often, these children left their Mormon home after a period of time, and it is likely that many of the Paiutes who sold their children did not intend it to be a permanent arrangement.⁵¹ Some Paiutes preferred Mormon assimilation of their children to the possibility of starvation or New Mexican slavery.52

Mormons who "adopted" Paiute children had various motivations in addi-

And Who Shall Have the Children?



Brigham Young, leader of the Mormons, selected Salt Lake Valley for the first settlement as it was the site least likely to provoke hostilities with the natives. Of foremost importance to Young and the Mormon leadership was the securing of a safe new home for their people. (*Nevada Historical Society*)

tion to a desire to follow the instructions of Brigham Young. Ethnocentric paternalism was a common reason. Through Mormon adoption, Indian children would be "redeemed from the thralldom of savage barbarity, and placed upon an equal footing with the more favored portions of the human race."⁵³ Salvation and conversion of the Lamanites was another stimulus for adoption, especially to missionaries. Lamanite children could be "cleansed of their old ways" easier than the adults, of whom "many of the old ones may continue in their habits and die off."⁵⁴ Mormon doctrine as well as compassion moved many Mormons to adopt Indian children found abused or starving, while other Mormons likely purchased children for their value as laborers; children were valuable assets on small farms.⁵⁵ Intertwined with these motivations for adoption was the Mormon concept of apprenticeship. The Indian "apprentices" would be fed, clothed, and educated–essentially taught how to be "white and delightsome," according to Mormon theology.

Native American child adoptees were typically well treated by their Mormon adopters, most of whom were prominent church officials and ministers. The children were generally fed, clothed, and educated in the same manner as other children in the household, and were also expected to work, as were the other children. Many adoptees, especially those procured as infants, shared a mutual bond of affection with their new "parents."⁵⁶ It should be noted that most accounts of the treatment of Paiute children in Mormon homes were written by Mormons, who would have been reluctant to record any abusive or unequal treatment of these children. As a result of disease and problems adjusting to the new diet and lifestyle, about 60 percent of the adoptees died by their early twenties, a mortality rate much higher than that of Mormon children.⁵⁷

Mormon society as a whole was not as accepting of Native American adoptees as were the Mormon adopters. Most of these children were disappointed in their efforts to find a Mormon spouse upon maturation, and many returned to their tribes in the hope of finding a mate.⁵⁸ Although some Native Americans were received into the church, a few even becoming honorary elders, most Mormons did not regard them as their peers. This was difficult for the Paiute adoptees to accept, deeply imprinted with Mormon ideals and values as children, they found that as adults they had no place in Mormon society.⁵⁹ One dying Native American woman, Lucy Meeks, had lived her entire life among the Mormons, felt that it had been a mistake ever to believe she could become a white and that Paiute children should stay among their own people where they could be happy.⁶⁰ Although Paiute adoptees were not usually allowed to assimilate fully into Mormon society, they were not treated as servants or slaves, which, the Mormons believed was the fate of Native American captives in New Mexico. While this was of little solace to mature Paiute adoptees, the distinction was significant to Mormons.

Despite the Mormon rhetoric, however, Mormon "adoption" of Indian chil-

dren had shared striking similarities to New Mexican enslavement. In both cases, the salvation, redemption, and civilization of the child were the most commonly cited motivations for the purchase of Native American children. Both Mormon and New Mexican promised to care for, "educate," and Christianize their wards, and both proceeded to rename and baptize the children. In neither Utah nor New Mexico were the adoptees allowed to assimilate fully or marry into the dominant culture; thus they became a permanently separate and distinct class of people outside of both Indian and Euroamerican societies.⁶¹

Although there were similarities between New Mexican servitude and Morman adoption, there is evidence to support that the Mormons were more benevolent than New Mexicans. In New Mexico, 40 percent of Native American children purchased were specifically identified as slaves; only 33 percent were identified as adoptees. Regardless of terminology, there appears to have been little difference in the status of slaves and adoptees in New Mexico; all purchased or captured Native Americans were collectively referred to as genízaros. In New Mexico, genízaros had a separate and subordinate niche both within their "families" and in the greater New Mexican community because of lack of good breeding, status, and honor — the defining characteristics of Spanish New Mexican society. In Utah, though Native American adoptees were distinct from other Mormons, they were not viewed with the same disdain as in New Mexico. Although both societies purported to educate and care for their wards, the Mormons fulfilled these promises with more zeal than did the New Mexicans. Ethnocentric paternalism characterized the perceptions of both Mormons and New Mexicans, but among Mormons it was hoped that one day the Lamanites would be "redeemed" and become "white and delightsome" while the Spanish New Mexicans had no such aspirations for their wards.⁶²

As the Mormons expanded their domain into Southern Paiute lands in southwestern Utah, their leaders re-evaluated the Ute and New Mexican slave trade. In contrast to their own concepts of adoption and apprenticeship, Mormons began to view Ute capture of Paiute children, and their subsequent New Mexican enslavement as harsh and cruel. Increasingly lurid and exaggerated Mormon accounts of the slave trade were a by-product of increased Mormon interaction with the victims of slavery, the Paiutes, as well as the Mormans' negative racial attitudes toward the New Mexicans, compounded by the recent war with Mexico. The Mormon leadership was also deeply concerned about guns and ammunition that were flowing from the New Mexicans to the Western Utes as a result of the slave trade: Armed New Mexicans and Utes in Utah were a possible threat to Mormon sovereignty.63 In 1851 Young and the Mormon Church leadership began a series of efforts to suppress the slave trade, culminating in the dispatch of a thirty-man militia force to arrest and deport New Mexicans in Utah.⁶ Young's order effectively ended the New Mexican involvement in the slave trade, and acquiring Paiute children directly from the Paiutes in exchange for food, rather than purchasing them from the Utes for guns or ammunition, became the preferred method of Mormon adoption.

Waccara responded to Young's order by raiding Mormon settlements in a confrontation that became known as the Walker (Waccara) War. Many other Utah Indians, aggrieved over a variety of issues, joined Waccara in rising up against the Mormons.⁶⁵ Waccara's limited goals were to seize Mormon cattle with which to feed his people and to force the Mormons to agree to perpetually purchase all the Paiute children he captured.⁶⁶ The Waccara War was very costly to the Mormons, but ended after just one year, when Brigham Young visited Waccara, presented him with gifts of food, guns, and ammunition, and, ironically, purchased an Indian child from him.⁶⁷ Although Young's action essentially acknowledged Waccara's right to engage in the slave trade, the Mormons had effectively eliminated the market for captives in Utah.

The slave trade began a gradual decline in the decade following the Waccara War. Waccara died in 1855, but other Western Utes continued to seize Paiute children, selling them to any Mormons still willing to purchase captives, or traveling to New Mexico to trade the children to Navajos or New Mexicans. But the Utes found fewer targets each year, as the Paiutes had discovered an effective defense against slave raids: Mormon settlement on their land.⁶⁸ The Paiutes initially began inviting Mormons to settle among them in 1850, and despite Ute protests by 1860 there were numerous Mormon settlements and missions among the Paiutes. The Utes found it far more difficult to raid Paiutes living under Mormon protection, and abandoned the slave trade in the early 1860s.⁶⁹

Although Mormon settlement of Paiute lands provided protection from slave raiders, it eventually became just as destructive as the slave trade had been. Contemporary Mormon accounts describe widespread Paiute starvation and rapidly decreasing Indian populations, and while many of these accounts should be dismissed as ethnocentric misunderstandings of Paiute subsistence, it is apparent from the more reliable sources that Paiutes increasingly experienced disease and shortages of resources following Mormon settlement.⁷⁰ Southern Paiute population on or near the Spanish Trail in 1859 was approximately 2,200, while in 1873, after extensive Mormon settlement, it had dropped to 1500. Considering that populations of these sizes likely produced between fifty and a hundred babies each year, it is apparent that approximately a hundred Paiutes were lost each year from all causes combined.⁷¹ There are no concrete data on Paiute losses to slavery, but clues on the frequency of raids, numbers of captives taken in raids, and known numbers of Paiute captives at various locations after sale suggest an estimate ranging between thirty and forty women and children per year. Losses to slavery, though significant, were therefore no greater than losses to the starvation and disease that followed Mormon settlement. Although Euroamerican importation of the slave trade, horses, and guns into the Great Basin had a tremendous and tragic cost for Southern Paiutes, Mormon settlement eventually resulted not only in more horrendous loss of life but also in dispossessing the Paiutes' land and resources.

The Western Ute presence in the southern Great Basin rapidly declined in the 1860s. In the face of ever-increasing numbers of Mormans and diminishing resources, and the slave trade or any other effective economic options, many Western Utes began a migration northeastward into the Uintah Basin. Starvation and disease exacted a severe toll on those who remained in Utah. A few remaining bands of Utes fought with the Mormons in the Blackhawk War of 1865-1866, but Mormon defensive measures eventually forced them to abandon their raids. By 1873, nearly all surviving Western Utes were on reservations.⁷²

Indian slavery and the slave trade in New Mexico were terminated in the 1860s, when the Union Army in New Mexico began to search for and return to their original people both Indian and New Mexican captives. The exchange of captives was initiated by the United States government in response to abolitionist pressures after the Civil War, but was also seen as an important step in a lasting peace in the region following the bloody campaign against the Navajos in 1863-1864. Although many Indians were returned to their tribes as a result of U. S. government efforts, no Paiutes were documented as being returned. Southern Paiute captives were fewer in numbers, far less politically important, and more difficult to return home than Navajo captives.⁷³

Mormon adoption of Paiute children gradually slowed in the I 860s, and by the 1870s had all but ceased. Mormons were weary of attempting to "save" the Lamanites, and the paucity of natives surviving in Western Utah combined with the rapid growth of Mormon population removed the necessity of continued efforts at assimilation.⁷⁴ Admitting the failure of his assimilation policy, Young declared in 1871 that "You need never fight the Indians, but if you want to get rid of them try to civilize them."⁷⁵ Referring specifically to Mormon adoption of Paiute children, he further stated that "We brought their children into our families and nursed and did everything for them it was possible to do for human beings, but die they would." As Paiute adoptees returned to their tribes to find mates or died from disease, all who remained among the Mormons were the few who found Mormon spouses. As they intermarried with whites over the generations, their descendants eventually appeared to the Mormons to be "white and delightsome" and were accepted into Mormon society.⁷⁶

NOTES

¹Daniel W. Jones, Forty Years among the Indians: A True Yet Thrilling Narrative of the Author's Experiences Among the Indians (Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1960), 50-51.

² For Domínguez's journey to the Great Basin, see Silvestre Velez de Escalante, *The Domínguez-Escalante Journal*, ed. Ted J. Warner, trans. Fray Angelico Chavez (Provo: Brigham Young University Press, 1976). The term *slavery*, as used in this essay, refers to enforced captivity of individuals and the vesting of property status on these individuals by their "masters" and the dominant society. Navajos, fur trappers, and travelers on the Spanish Trail are also known to have engaged in the slave trade, but their participation in the Utah slave trade was minimal and will not be considered in detail here.

³Several monographs examine Indian slavery in other regions and serve to place the Utah slave trade in a larger context. Among the Native American tribes in the Northwest, there was an extensive precontact slave trade; see Robert H. Ruby and John A. Brown, *Indian Slavery in the Pacific Northwest*, with a foreword by Jay Miller (Spokane: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1993). The Comanche and other Southern Plains Indian tribes began an extensive slave trade with Euroamericans in the eighteenth century; see Russell Mario Magnaghi, "The Indian Slave Trader: The Comanche, a Case Study" (Ph.D. diss., Saint Louis University, 1970). Many Northern Plains tribes, while not engaging in a slave trade, did take large numbers of captives in intertribal conflicts, usually integrating these captives into their tribe; see Anthony McGinnis, *Counting Coup and Cutting Horses: Intertribal Warfare on the Northern Plains*, *1738-1889* (Evergreen, Colorado: Cordillera Press, Inc., 1992). The Mojave Indians of California had experiences with slavery similar to the Southern Paiutes; see Gerald A. Smith and Clifford J. Walker, *Indian Slave Trade along the Mojave Trail* (San Bernardino: San Bernardino County Museum, 1965). Also see William Christie MacLeod, "Economic Aspects of Indigenous American Slavery," *American Anthropologist*, 30 (1928): 632-50.

⁴Joseph J. Hill, "Spanish and Mexican Exploration and Trade Northwest from New Mexico into the Great Basin, 1765-1853," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 3:1 (January 1930), 17-19.

⁵The illegality of the New Mexican slave trade with the Utes unfortunately leaves historians with few records of such activity during the years between Domínguez's expedition in 1776 and the opening of the Spanish Trail to caravan traffic in 1830. Records of the Arze-García expedition exist only because the group was caught by New Mexican officials upon their return to New Mexico for violating a 1778 law against trade with the Indians and an 1812 law against Indian slavery. These laws were commonly ignored; see LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen, *Old Spanish Trail: Sante Fe to Los Angeles, With Extracts From Contemporary Records and Including Diaries of Antonio Armíjo and Orville Pratt*, The Far West and the Rockies Historical Series, 1820-1875, vol.1 (Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1954), 262-64; S. Lyman Tyler, "The Spaniard and the Ute," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 22:4, (October 1954), 349-61; John R. Alley, Jr., "Prelude to Dispossession: The Fur Trader's Significance for the Northern Utes and Southern Paiutes," Utah Historical Quarterly 50:2 (Spring 1982), 107-13; Hill, *Spanish and Mexican Exploration and Trade*, 17-19.

⁶Slavery in various forms existed in New Mexico for centuries prior to the Arze-García expedition. The *encomienda* and *repartimiento* were systems of enforced Indian labor that the Spanish used to exploit Indians from early in their colonization of New Mexico. After the *Reconquista* of New Mexico in 1692, the Spanish began reaching into the deserts and plains past their New Mexican settlements for slaves to fuel their labor needs and expand their empire. Captives from "wars" with the Navajos and other Indians were used by the Spanish as mining and manufacturing laborers. Although enslavement of Indians other than captives of war was illegal in New Mexico, this restriction was rarely enforced, and wealthy New Mexicans often sought Indians as domestic servants under the guise of "apprenticeship." By 1813, when Arze and García traveled to the Great Basin, Indian women and children sold for several dollars each in Santa Fe. For the slave market in New Mexico, see Magnaghi, "Indian Slave Trade," Lynn Robinson Bailey, *Indian Slave Trade in the Southwest* (Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1966); Frank McNitt, *Navajo Wars: Military Campaigns, Slave Raids, and Reprisals* (Albuquerque: The University of New Mexico Press, 1972); and Ramon A. Gutierrez, *When Jesus Came, the Corn Mothers Went Away: Marriage, Sexuality, and Power in New Mexico, 1500-1846* (Stanford: Stanford University

Press, 1991).

⁷Joel Clifford Janetski, "The Western Ute of Utah Valley: An Ethnohistoric Model of Lakeside Adaptation" (Ph.D. diss., University of Utah, 1983), 35-75.

⁸See Alley, "Prelude to Dispossession;" also Hafen and Hafen, *Spanish Trail*, 261. Even after the fur traders' Rocky Mountain rendezvous were established and traders no longer returned to New Mexico on a regular basis, Utah still continued to be trafficked heavily by trappers/traders.

⁹For band development and its effects, see Elliot West, *The Way to the West: Essays on the Central Plains* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995), 19-27; Julian Haynes Steward, "Aboriginal and Historical Groups of the Ute Indians of Utah: An Analysis and Supplement," in *Ute Indians 1*, Garland Series, American Indian Ethnohistory: California and Great Basin Plateau Indians, ed. David Agee Horr (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1974).

¹⁰For examples of early Ute bands, see Jedediah S. Smith, *The Southwest Expedition of Jedediah Strong Smith. His Personal Account of the Journey to California, 1826-1827, ed. and with an introduction by George R. Brooks (Glendale, California: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1977), 42-4; Warren Angus Ferris, <i>Life in the Rocky Mountains, 1830-1835, ed. J. Cecil Alter and Herbert S. Auerbach (Salt Lake City: Rocky Mountain Book Shop), 219-20.*

¹¹Isabel T. Kelly and Catherine S. Fowler, 1940, "Southern Paiute," in *Handbook of the North American Indians* Vol.II, *Great Basin*, ed. Warren D'Azevedo (Washington: Smithsonian Institution, 1986), 370-71; Hafen and Hafen, *Spanish Trail*, 281.

¹²Robert C. Euler, *Southern Paiute Ethnohistory*, in University of Utah Anthropological Papers no. 78 (Salt Lake City: The University of Utah Press, 1973), 103; Demitri B. Shimkin, *The Introduction of the Horse*, in D'Azevedo, *Handbook*, 521.

¹³George Douglas Brewerton, Overland with Kit Carson, A Narrative of the Old Spanish Trail in '48, with an Introduction by Stallo Vinton (New York: Coward-McCann, Inc., 1930), 80, 95; Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 281; John C. Frémont, Narratives of Exploration and Adventure, ed. Allan Nevins (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1956), 404.

¹⁴Hafen and Hafen, *Spanish Trail*, 155-194; Eleanor Lawrence, "The Old Spanish Trail from Santa Fe to California" (thesis, University of California, Berkeley, 1930), passim; for an excellent first-hand description of a New Mexican caravan on the Spanish Trail in 1845, see Brewerton, *Overland with Kit Carson*, 58-60; for examples of small parties of trappers and traders on the trail in 1841, see Winona Adams, ed., "An Indian Girl's Story of a Trading Expedition to the Southwest about 1841," *The Frontier* (May 1930), 338-67. En route to and from California, the massive New Mexican caravans ravaged the Southern Paiute ecosystem, destroying crops, depleting game, and consuming grasslands. Small grasslands along streams and springs common to Paiute territory along the Spanish Trail were especially vulnerable to damage from overgrazing. When the caravans returned to New Mexico in the spring with large herds of horses acquired in California, they overgrazed the Paiute lands at precisely the worst time of year for such action. Consistent overgrazing in the spring decreased the ability of these grasses to recover; see West, *Way to the West*, 32-37; Brewerton, *Overland with Kit Carson*, 58; Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 346.

¹⁵Orville C. Pratt, Diarist: The Journal of Orville C. Pratt, 1848, ed. with an introduction by LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen, in Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 352-353; Thomas J. Farnham, An 1839 Wagon Train Journal: Travels in the Great Western Prairies, the Anahuac and Rocky Mountains, and in the Oregon Territory (New York: Greeley and Mc Elrath, 1843), 55; Pierre-Jean de Smet, Life, Letters and Travels of Father Pierre-Jean de Smet, S. J, 1801-1873, vol. 4, ed. Hiram Martin Chittenden and Alfred Talbot Richardson (New York: Francis P. Harper, 1905), 990; Howard Louis Conard, Uncle Dick Wootton: The Pioneer Frontiersman of the Rocky Mountain Region, The Lakeside Classics, ed. Milo Milton Quaife (Chicago: The Lakeside Press, 1957), 65; Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 344-351, 367; Thomas J. Farnham, Travels in California and Scenes in the Pacific Ocean (New York: Saxton and Miles, 1844), 377-379; Jones, Among the Indians, 48-49; Brewerton, Overland with Kit Carson, 58-61, 80; James P. Beckwourth, The Life and Adventures of James P. Beckwourth, ed. T. D. Bonner (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1931), 349; H. S. Brown, "Account By Judge H. S. Brown" in LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen, The Far West and Rockies General Analytical Index to the Fifteen Volume Series and Supplement to the Journals of 'Forty-Niners, Salt Lake to Los Angeles, The Far West and the Rockies Historical Series, 1820-1875, vol. 15 (Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1961), 26; Gwinn Harris Heap, Central Route to the Pacific, from the Valley of the Mississippi

Stephen P. Van Hoak

to California: Journal of the Expedition of E. F. Beale, Superintendent of Indian Affairs in California, and Gwinn Harris Heap, from Missouri to California, in 1853, The Far West and the Rockies Historical Series, 1820-1875, ed. with an Introduction by LeRoy R. Hafen and Ann W. Hafen, vol. 7 (Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1957), 235.

16 Heap, Central Route, 235.

¹⁷Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 271; Farnham, 1839 Wagon Train Journal, 55; Kelly and Fowler, Southern Paiute, 370-71.

¹⁸Euler, Southern Paiute Ethnohistory, 103; Ronald L. Holt, Beneath These Red Cliffs: An Ethnohistory of the Utah Paiutes, with a Foreword by Floyd O'Neil (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1992), 6-11.

¹⁹For smoke signals, see De Smet, *Life*, *Letters*, and *Travels*, 989-90; Brewerton, *Overland with Kit Carson*, 82-83, 94; Beckwourth, *James P. Beckwourth*, 349; Heap, *Central Route*, 236-37; Smith, *Jedediah Strong Smith*, 50-51.

²⁰Brewerton, Overland with Kit Carson, 74-76, 82-83; Beckwourth, James P. Beckwourth, 348-49; Heap, Central Route, 234-36; Smith, Jedediah Strong Smith, 33-67; De Smet, Life, Letters, and Travels, 989-90; Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 344-51; Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 352-55; Pratt, Diarist, 352-55.

²¹De Smet, *Life, Letters, and Travels,* 990; Brewerton, *Overland with Kit Carson,* 80; Garland Hurt, "Indians of Utah," in James Harvey Simpson, *Report of Explorations across the Great Basin of the Territory of Utah for a Direct Wagon Route from Camp Floyd to Genoa, in Carson Valley, in* 1859, Vintage Nevada Series (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1983), 461-62; Annie Heloise Abel, ed., *The Official Correspondence of James S. Calhoun while Indian Agent at Sante Fe and Superintendent of Indian Affairs in New Mexico* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1915), 536-37; Jones, *Among the Indians,* 48-49; Heap, *Central Route,* 235; Juanita Brooks, *John Doyle Lee: Zealot - Pioneer Builder - Scapegoat* (Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 1979), 163, 172; Thomas D. Brown, *Journal of the Southern Indian Mission: Diary of Thomas D. Brown*, Juanita Brooks, ed. (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1972), 104-5; *Deseret News* (Salt Lake City), 4 April 1855. It is unknown how the children to be sold were selected. Paiute chiefs traditionally did not exercise much power, although after Euroamerican contact there is evidence this power increased. Whether children to be sold were selected by the chief, or whether sick or orphaned children were chosen, or whether there was some other method of selection, is unknown.

²²Isabel T. Kelly, *Southern Paiute Ethnography*, in *Paiute Indians 1*, Garland Series, American Indian Ethnohistory: California and Great Basin Plateau Indians, ed. David Agee Horr (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1976), 91.

²³William R. Palmer, "Pahute Indian Government and Laws," Utah Historical Quarterly 2:2 (April 1929): 38-40; Farnham, *Travels in California*, 378; Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 344-51; Juanita Brooks, "Indian Relations on the Mormon Frontier," Utah Historical Quarterly 12:1-2 (January-April 1944), 14; William L. Knecht and Peter L. Crawley, eds., "History of Utah," in *History of Brigham Young*, 1847-1867 (Berkeley: Mass Cal Associates, 1966), 129-30; Deseret News, 7 August, 1852.

²⁴Palmer, "Pahute Indian Government and Laws," 40.

²⁵Ibid., 38-39; Pratt, *Diarist*, 352-53; Elizabeth Wood Kane, *Twelve Mormon Homes Visited in Succession on a Journey through Utah to Arizona*, with an Introduction by Everett L. Cooley (Salt Lake City: Tanner Trust Fund, University of Utah Library, 1974), 40; Hafen and Hafen, *Spanish Trail*, 281; Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 344-51; Andrew Jensen, ed., *History of Las Vegas Mission*, in *Nevada State Historical Society Papers*, 1925-1926 (Reno: Nevada State Historical Society, 1926), 183; Brooks, *John Doyle Lee*, 172; William L. Manly, *Death Valley in '49*, The Lakeside Classics, ed. Milo Milton Quaife (Chicago: The Lakeside Press, 1927), 150-51; Bailey, *Slave Trade*, 163.

²⁶Heap, Central Route, 235.

²⁷Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 344-45.

²⁸Holt, Red Cliffs, 20; Hurt, "Indians of Utah," 462.

²⁹For women's responsibilities in Western Ute culture, see Holt, *Red Cliffs*, 20; Kelly and Fowler, *Southern Paiute*, 370. It is possible that the violent competition rituals between male Southern Paiutes over courtship rights of females as witnessed by Mormons evolved from a dearth of women in some areas as a result of the slave trade; see James A. Little, *Jacob Hamblin: A Narrative of His Personal Experience, as a Frontiersman, Missionary to the Indians and Explorer, Disclosing*

Interpositions of Providence, Severe Privations, Perilous Situations and Remarkable Escapes (Freeport, New York: Books for Libraries Press, 1971), 34-36.

³⁰See Jones, Among the Indians, 50-51; "Utah Laws against Indian Slavery," Utah Historical Quarterly 2:3 (July 1929), 84; Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 271; Solomon Nunes Carvalho, Incidents of Travel and Adventure in the Far West with Colonel Fremont's Last Expedition across the Rocky Mountains: Including Three Months' Residence in Utah, and a Perilous Trip across the Great American Desert, to the Pacific (New York: Derby and Jackson, 1859), 194; Brooks, John Doyle Lee, 163; "Reminiscences of the Early Days of Manti," Utah Historical Quarterly 6:4 (October 1933), 119; Peter Gottfredson, ed., History of Indian Depredations in Utah (Salt Lake City: Skelton Publishing, 1919), 84, 319-20; Palmer, "Pahute Indian Government and Laws," 38; John Williams Gunnison, The Mormons, or, Latter-Day Saints, in the Valley of the Great Salt Lake: A History of their Rise and Progress, Peculiar Doctrines, Present Condition, and Prospects, Derived from Personal Observation during a Residence among Them (Freeport, New York: Books for Libraries Press, 1972), 149. When a prominent Ute died, captive children were often buried alive with the corpse, a practice apparently new to Western Ute culture; see CarIng Malouf and A. Arline Malouf, "The Effects of Spanish Slavery on the Indians of the Intermountain West," Southwestern Journal of Anthropology, 1:3 (1945), 388.

³¹For slave raiding and trading by Waccara's band, see McNitt, *Navajo Wars*, 442-46; Gottfredson, *Indian Depredations*, 318-19; Jones, *Among the Indians*, 48; Daniel H. Wells, "Daniel H. Wells' Narrative," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 6:4 (October 1933), 130; Hurt, "Indians of Utah," 461; Palmer, "Pahute Indian Government and Laws," 38-39; "Reminiscences," 119-20; Knecht and Crawley, *History of Utah*, 129; *Deseret News*, 19 March, 1853, 4 April, 1855; Brown, *Southern Indian Mission*, 104-105; Brooks, *John Doyle Lee*, 163, 172; Carvalho, *Travel and Adventure*, 194.

³²Despite his success at the slave trade, horse raiding was Waccara's most successful and profitable enterprise. Between 1849 and 1853, Waccara's band stole approximately 2000 horses, often in large raids with othe Indians or destitute American trappers. They retained the best horses and traded the remainder for guns, ammunition, and other European products. The effects of Waccara's slave raids on the Paiutes were compounded by further decimation of the Paiute ecosystem by the vast herds of stolen horses Waccara drove across the Spanish Trail from California; see Jones, *Among the Indians*, 39; Hafen and Hafen, *Spanish Trail*, 227-57; Lawrence, "Old Spanish Trail," 86-100.

³³Floyd O'Neil and Stanford J. Layton, "Of Pride and Politics: Brigham Young as Indian Superintendent, *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 46:3 (Summer 1978), 237; Howard A. Christy, "Open Hand and Mailed Fist: Mormon-Indian Relations in Utah, 1847-1852," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 46:3 (Summer 1978), 218-19.

³⁴The theory that Native Americans were descendants of a tribe of Israel was not originated by the Mormons. As early as the seventeenth century, the theory was popular in Europe; see Brooks, "Indian Relations," 2; O'Neil and Layton, "Of Pride and Politics," 238-39; Holt, *Red Cliffs*, 22-25; Lawrence George Coates, "A History of Indian Education by the Mormons, 1830-1900" (Ph.D. diss., Ball State University, 1969). 28-62; Julina Smith, "A Discussion of the Inter-Relations of the Latter-Day Saints and the American Indians" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1932), 8-29. Indian affairs in Utah throughout this period were dictated by Young and the Mormon leadership.

35See Christy, Open Hand, 217-33.

³⁶Steward, *Groups of the Ute*, 17-18, 29-30, 46-47, 67-70; horse culture and band development often increased social and political division; see West, *Way to the West*, 20.

³⁷William L. Knecht and Peter L. Crawley, eds., "Early Records of Utah," in *History of Brigham Young*, 22-23, 57-59, 63; "Reminiscences," 122; J. Marius Jensen, *Early History of Provo*, Utah (Provo, Utah: J. Mains Jensen, 1924), 59-60

³⁸ Solomon F. Kimball, "From Thrilling Experiences," in Gottfredson, *Indian Depredations*, 15-17.

³⁹Coates, *Indian Education*, 83-84. In early battles at Utah Lake between the Mormons and Utes, a number of women and children were taken captive by the Mormons, and some were taken into Mormon homes. Most were allowed to leave their Mormon homes soon thereafter, however; see Wells, "David H. Wells' Narrative," 126; Knecht and Crawley, "Early Records," 72.

⁴⁰"Reminiscences," 119.

⁴¹Richard W. Stoffle and Michael J. Evans, "Resource Competition and Population Change: A Kaibab Paiute Ethnohistorical Case," *Ethnohistory*, 23:2 (Spring 1976), 180-81; O'Neil and Layton, "Of Pride and Politics," 247-48; H. Bartley Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations as Viewed through the Walker War" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1955), 26; *Deseret News*, 19 March 1853. Native Americans and Euroamericans competing for and exhausting riverside grasslands, such as those near Utah Valley, was a consistent theme of American westward expansion; see West, *Way to the West*, 25-27.

⁴²Gottfredson, Indian Depredations, 318-320; Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations," 13, 26.

⁴³Native Americans were dependent on Euroamerican traders for ammunition and replacements for malfunctioning guns; without this resupply, guns quickly became worthless. Horses also required replenishment of losses due to disease, theft, and weather. Bands of the Central Plains maintained between five and thirteen horses per person for this purpose; see West, *Way to the West*, 21-22.

44For the northeastward retreating buffalo frontier, see West, *Way to the West*, *57*; Steward, *Groups of the Ute*, 9-10, 14; Smith, *Jedediah Strong Smith*, 41, 46-47; Adams, "An Indian Girl's Story," 345; Hurt, "Aboriginal and Historical Indians of Utah," 460-61; Ferris, *Life in the Rocky Mountains*, 69; "Some Source Documents in Utah indian Slavery," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 2:3 (July 1929), 75. For decline of fur trade, see Alley, "Prelude to Dispossession," 113. American soldiers were more numerous, better armed, and more organized than their Mexican predecessors. During the Mexican War, the Mormon Battalion guarded Cajon Pass in California, effectively preventing horse raiding into that region. Thus the Mormons began affecting Ute subsistence efforts even prior to their arrival in Utah. For increased danger of horse raids, see Hafen and Hafen, *Spanish Trail*, 248-57.

⁴⁵Howard A. Christy, "The Walker War: Defense and Conciliation as Strategy" Utah Historical Quarterly, 47:4 (Fall 1979), 396; Coates, "Indian Education," 88.

⁴⁶ For Waccara's Utes and other similar bands, the numerous advantages and powerful allure of horse culture generated dependency on that way of life; see Shimkin, *Introduction of the Horse*, 521-23.

⁴⁷5ee Jack Beller, "Negro Slaves in Utah," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 2:3 (July 1929); Newell G. Bringhurst, "An Ambiguous Decision: The Implementation of Mormon Priesthood Denial for the Black Man - A Reexamination," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 46:1 (Winter 1978); and Stephen G. Taggart, *Mormonism's Negro Policy: Social and Historical Origins* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1970).

⁴⁸Brooks, "Indian Relations," 6.

49*Ibid*.

⁵⁰Priddy Meeks, "Journal of Priddy Meeks," Utah Historical Quarterly 10:3-4 (May-August 1942), 146.

⁵¹John Doyle Lee, A Mormon Chronicle: The Diaries of John D. Lee, 1848-1876., ed. Robert Glass Cleland and Juanita Brooks (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1983), 168, 238; Malouf and Malouf, "Effects of Spanish Slavery," 186.

⁵²For instances of Mormon "adoption," see Israel Bennion, "Indian Reminiscences," Utah Historical Quarterly, 2:2 (1929), 44-45; Brooks, John Doyle Lee, 163-64, 172, 238; Palmer, Pahute Indian Government and Laws, 38, 40; Wells, "Daniel H. Wells' Narrative," 126; Brown, Southern Indian Mission, 11, 27, 60, 105, 111, 135; Lee, Mormon Chronicle I, 168, 215, 238; Little, Jacob Hamblin, 30; Brooks, "Indian Relations," 5-9; Heap, Central Route, 223-24; Abel, Correspondence of James S. Calhoun, 536; Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 271; Juanita Brooks, On the Ragged Edge: The Life and Times of Dudley Leavitt (Salt Lake City: Utah State Historical Society, 1973), 106-7; Jensen, Early History of Provo, 56; Coates, "Indian Education," 84-85; Kate B. Carter, "Indian Slavery of the West," Daughters of Utah Pioneers (May 1938), 13-17; Knecht and Crawley, "Early Records," 72; Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations," 40; Carvalho, Travel and Adventure, 194.

⁵³Deseret News, 10 January 1852.

54Brown, Journal of the Southern Indian Mission, 35.

⁵⁴West, *Way to the West*, 93-94, 97; O'Neil and Layton, "Of Pride and Politics," 240; Coates, "Indian Education," 153-54; Carter, "Indian Slavery," 4, 15-19; "Utah Laws," 84-86.

⁵⁶Kane Twelve Mormon Homes, 39-40; Palmer, "Pahute Indian Government and Laws," 38, 40; Carvalho, Travel and Adventure, 194; Little, Jacob Hamblin, 30, 86-87; Coates, "Indian Education," 155-156; Kimball, "Thrilling Experiences," 16-18; Brooks, On the Ragged Edge, 93, 103, 106-107; Bennion, "Indian Reminiscences," 44-45; Lee, Mormon Chronicle, 279; Brooks, John Doyle Lee, 238, 251; Brown, Journal of Southern Indian Mission, 135; Brooks, "Indian Relations," 33-48; Carter, "Indian Slavery," 13-19; Heap, Central Route, 223-24; Meeks, "Journal," 146; Wells, "Daniel H. Wells' Narrative," 126, 130. For an exception to benevolent treatment of adoptees, see Carter, "Indian Slavery," 17.

⁵⁷The estimate of 60 percent is based upon an examination of all documented accounts of adoptees cited in this essay.

58Brooks, John Doyle Lee, 238, 251.

⁵⁹Kane, *Twelve Mormon Homes*, 71-72; Palmer, "Pahute Indian Government and Laws," 38, 40; Little, *Jacob Hamblin*, 86-87; Coates, "Indian Education," 155-56; Kimball, *Thrilling Experiences*, 16-18; Brooks, *On the Ragged Edge*, 94-95, 106-7; John Doyle Lee, *Mormon Frontier*, 214; Brooks, "Indian Relations," 33-41, 46-47; Bennion, "Indian Reminiscences," 44-45; Carter, "Indian Slavery," 14-19.

⁶⁰Brooks, "Indian Relations," 37-38.

⁶¹For fate of Indian child captives in New Mexico, see Gutierrez, When Jesus Came, 180-88, 304-05; Abel, Correspondence of James S. Calhoun, 537; DeSmet, Life, Letters, and Travels, 990; Jones, Forty Years Among the Indians, 48; Beckwourth, James P. Beckwourth, 349; Hafen and Hafen, Spanish Trail, 273-74; "Government Inquiry into Condition of Indians," Utah Historical Quarterly, 2:3 (July 1929), 87-90; Bailey, Slave Trade, 73, 128-30, 187.

62Ibid.

63Coates, "Indian Education," 87-88; Heap, Central Route, 206.

⁶⁴"Utah Laws," 84-86; *Deseret News*, 15 November 1851, 10 January 1852, 30 April 1853; Coates, "Indian Education," 86-87; Abel, *Correspondence of James S. Calhoun*, 51, 531, 536-37.

⁶⁵Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations," 26-42, 80-81; Christy, "Walker War," 395-420; Christy, "Open Hand," 227-28; Carvalho, *Travel and Adventure*, 191-93; *Deseret News*, 29 November 1851, 19 March 1853.

66Coates, "Indian Education," 90; Heap, Central Route, 224.

⁶⁷For details of war, see Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations,"43-79; Christy, "Walker War," 398-416; Knecht and Crawley, "History of Utah," 131-44. For cost of war, see Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations," 92-6. For the ending of the war and Brigham Young's visit to Waccara, see Heiner, "Mormon-Indian Relations," 85-88; Carvalho, *Travel and Adventure*, 188-194; Christy, "Walker War," 417

⁶⁸Protection from the Utes was not the principal reason for Paiutes inviting Mormons onto their lands. Devastation of their land on the Spanish Trail, as well as disease, slaving, and warfare, had ravaged these people, and by the mid 1850s, the Paiutes were desperate for assistance in any form. See Martha C. Knack, "Nineteenth Century Great Basin Indian Wage Labor in Native Americans and Wage Labor:" *Ethnohistorical Perspectives*, eds. Alice Littlefield and Martha C. Knack (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1996), 145-46; Holt, *Red Clifs*, 25; Kelly and Fowler, *Southern Paiute*, 386-87; *Deseret News*, 4 September 1852, 4 April 1855.

⁶⁹Lee, Mormon Chronicle, 167, 215; Jensen, Historical Las Vegas Mission, 183; Brooks, "Indian Relations," 9-13; Deseret News, 13 December 1851, 7 August 1852, 7 December 1852, 16 February 1854, 4 April 1855; Euler, Southern Paiute Ethnohistory, 55-56.

⁷⁰Stoffle and Evans, "Resource Competition," 180-92; Holt, *Red Cliffs*, 30; O'Neil and Layton, "Of Pride and Politics," 241-42; Kelly and Fowler, *Southern Paiute*, 387.

⁷¹Simpson, Report of Explorations, 34; Joy Leland, Population, in D'Azevedo, Handbook, 609.

⁷²Eli F. Taylor, "Indian Reservations in Utah," Utah Historical Quarterly, 4:1 (January 1931), 29; Steward Groups of the Ute, 27-29; Leland, Population, 609.

73Bailey, Indian Slave Trade, 128-37, 183-87; McNitt, Slave Raids, 441-46.

⁷⁴Brooks, "Indian Relations," 25, 33. Low fertility and high mortality rates by Native Americans countered by high fertility and low mortality rates of Euroamericans was a dominant theme of the American westward expansion, resulting in a Euroamerican "generational juggernaut." See West, *Way to the West*, 90-93.

⁷⁵O'Neil and Layton, *Of Pride and Politics*, 241-42. ⁷⁶Brooks, "Indian Relations," 39, 48.

THE MAKING OF MARK TWAIN

Brian Scot Hagen

One of America's best known writers, the author of *The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn*, was born in Virginia City, Nevada Territory. Some might disagree: Some people might say Mark Twain was born in Missouri, on November 30, 1835. Others, that his career as an author did not begin until he published books, years after Samuel Clemens left Virginia City. However, the name Mark Twain signifies more than an adopted pen name—it symbolizes a striking individual, separate from Samuel Langhorne Clemens. Although the two personalities overlap in some aspects and at times pretend to be each other, they are unique, as each serves a different purpose for the one man. Yes, Mark Twain was being formed in the womb of Samuel Clemens's mind for most of his life, but it took the wildness of Virginia City to scare the infant out.

The free-spirited Samuel Clemens was born November 30, 1835, in Florida, Missouri, to John M. and Jane L. Clemens. The family moved to Hannibal, Missouri, in 1839, where John sat in a circuit-court jury that sent abolitionists to prison.¹ Samuel received much of his education here:

I was educated not only in the common school at Hannibal but also in my brother Orion's newspaper office, there I served in all capacities, including staff work. My literature attracted the town's attention "but not its admiration."²

A few years later came another high point in Clemens's life, as he began to earn a high wage as a steamboat pilot on the Mississippi River. He received his piloting license in 1859 and at age twenty-three, was earning \$250 a month. This career shortly ended however because the Civil War stopped the passage on the River.³

He then traveled west with his brother, Orion, who was commissioned as secretary to the Nevada Territory by President Abraham Lincoln. Samuel Clemens clerked for the legislature briefly, then tried his hand at mining.⁴ In Aurora, he learned much about the mining trade—how to dig properly as well as how to buy and trade stock in the mines. He did not strike it rich; in fact, he began to lose hope and became frustrated with his failures.

Brian Scot Hagen did his undergraduate work in English and theology. He presently lives in Dayton, Nevada and works in Carson City as an electronics technician. This paper was originally presented at the Fifth Biennial Conference on Nevada History at the Nevada Historical Society in Reno in 1997.

The Making of Mark Twain



One of the earliest photographs of Samuel Langhorne Clemens. A giant figure in the United States and a legend in his own time. His brother, Orion, was secretary to the Governor of Nevada. (*Nevada Historical Society*)



Office of the *Territorial Enterprise* in Virginia City, Nevada, circa 1881. (Nevada Historical Society)



Virginia City, Nevada, circa 1880s. (Nevada Historical Society)

The Making of Mark Twain

During his stay at Aurora, Clemens sent articles to the *Territorial Enterprise* in Virginia City, which resulted in an offer to join the staff at \$25 per week. Clemens was not confident of his abilities and wasn't sure that the offer sounded terribly good, but he felt it was his only choice. This pressure, something like a labor pain, signaled the approaching birth of Mark Twain.

Clemens walked the 130 miles to Virginia City. At this time, he was 26 years old, stood 5 feet, 8.5 inches tall, and weighed 145 pounds. He had a large head and dark, bushy eyebrows. According to the account from *Roughing It*, he arrived at the office of the *Territorial Enterprise* "a rusty-looking city editor."

Clemens's self-confidence was dependent upon public opinion. He wore a gun and a slick look to please others, but gradually he learned he could act according to his own inclinations. Much later in his life, Clemens wrote the following:

I had no desire to fight a duel. I had no intentions of provoking one. I did not feel respectable but I got a certain amount of satisfaction out of *feeling* safe. I was ashamed of myself, the rest of the staff were ashamed of me—but I got along well enough. I had always been accustomed to feeling ashamed of myself, for one thing or another, so there was no novelty for me in the situation. I bore it very well.⁵

Virginia City accepted Clemens just the way he was. They were a good match for each other, and Clemens certainly held a high opinion of Virginia City.

Virginia had grown to be the liveliest town, for its age and population, that America had ever produced Joy sat on every countenance, and there was a glad, almost fierce, intensity in every eye, that told of the money-getting schemes that were seething in every brain and the high hope that held sway in every heart. . . . [It] claimed a population of fifteen to eighteen thousand, and all day long half of the little army swarmed the streets like bees and the other half swarmed the drifts and tunnels of the "Comstock," hundreds of feet down in the earth directly under those same streets. Often we felt our chairs jar, and heard the faint boom of a blast down in the bowels of the earth under the office.⁶

This was the climate for which Clemens was hired to the write news. And it was in this rough and wild atmosphere that his writing evolved.

Clemens began to form his trademark style his first day on the job at the *Enterprise*. He wrote a story about sixteen wagons coming into town, even though there was really only one. He also wrote about a murder, sounding happy that the crime happened, and he invented most of a story about a wagon caught in an Indian fight.⁷

My two columns were filled. When I read them over in the morning I felt that I had found my legitimate occupation at last. I reasoned within myself that news and stirring news, too, was what a paper needed, and I felt that I was peculiarly endowed with the ability to furnish it. Mr. Goodman said that I was as good a reporter as Dan [De Quille]. I desired no higher commendation. With encouragement like that, I felt that I could take my pen and murder all the immigrants on the Plains if need be and the interests of the paper demanded it.⁸

Here, Clemens describes his style of embellishment as "stirring news." And we see how his confidence is boosted by Goodman's unusually high praise, a comparison to the talented Dan De Quille. This day began Clemens's writing career.

One of his most famous stories is "The Petrified Man." Clemens meant to use the story to make a point, but many people took it seriously. It reports the discovery of a man who had died a hundred years before and had been perfectly preserved except for part of his leg. The body was supposedly cemented to bedrock with limestone sediment, and was posed in a nose-thumbing and eye-winking position.

Clemens continued to grow in confidence in himself and in his writing. His self-assurance had much to do with finding the right combination of truth and exaggeration, seriousness and humor, accuracy and entertainment. One way Clemens demonstrated this confidence was through boasting:

No paper in the United States can afford to pay me what my place on the Enterprise is worth. If I were not naturally a lazy, idle, good for nothing vagabond, I could make it pay me \$20,000 a year. But I don't suppose I shall ever by any account. I lead an easy life, though I don't care a cent whether school keeps or not. Everybody knows me, and I fare like a prince wherever I go, be it on this side of the mountains or the other. And I am proud to say I am the most conceited ass in the territory.⁹

Clemens became a valuable part of life on the Comstock. His articles became part of the wildness, adding his unique humor and point of view. Joseph Goodman and Dan DeQuille helped Clemens with his news reporting and story development, whereas Rollin Daggett taught him efficiency. Clemens also picked up some knowledge about the social commentary aspect of reporting. This all combined to build up his confidence. A passage from *The Autobiography of Mark Twain* reveals one aspect of the importance of confidence. His brother says of him,

Except in the matter of grounded principle, he was as unstable as water. . . . He was so eager to be approved, so girlishly anxious to be approved by anybody and everybody, without discrimination, that he was commonly ready to forsake his notions, opinions, and convictions at a moment's notice in order to get the approval of any person who disagreed with them.¹⁰

Clemens's first known use of the name Mark Twain appeared on February 3, 1863. Years later, he offered an explanation for adopting this pen name: He took the name for himself in honor of the river pilot Isaiah Sellers who died in 1864 and as was the practice, used the term to signify the depth of the river water. Other explanations seem more likely. One example is set, appropriately, in a bar, a place to relax, socialize, and have fun. Clemens had a running account on the wall of John Piper's bar. When he picked up the tab for a drinking buddy, he would say to Piper, "Mark Twain," meaning two chalk marks on the



Clemens's confidence was boosted by Joseph T. Goodman's unusually high praise, a comparison to the talented Dan De Quille. Goodman was editor of the *Territorial Enterprise*. (*Nevada Historical Society*)



Goodman and Dan DeQuille helped Clemens with his news reporting and story development. (Nevada Historical Society)

wall for his account.

The use of "Mark Twain" followed his earlier use of "Josh," during his Aurora days. The successful author's career was not yet clinched. One crucial event in this regard was the publication of his article "A Bloody Massacre Near Carson" in the *Territorial Enterprise* on October 28, 1863. In Kent Rasmussen's *Mark Twain: A to Z*, the story is retold:

According to Adam Curry (a real person), a man named P. or Philip Hopkins, who lived on the edge of the pine forest between Empire City and Dutch Nick's, rode into Carson with a bloody scalp in his hand and his own throat slit from ear to ear. After five minutes without speaking, he dropped dead in front of the Magnolia Saloon. Sheriff Gasherie (a real person) immediately led a party out to Hopkins' house, where they found the butchered remains of his wife and seven of his children. Two daughters survived to explain what happened.

Many people believed the story to be true and it spread, with the result that Clemens became one of the most widely known writers of the West Coast. Many were angry once they found out the story was not true. Clemens didn't understand the public reaction, but he felt that he had made a terrible mistake and offered to resign from the paper. He soon recovered, with the help of his friends from the *Enterprise*, and shortly afterward entered into a second level of maturity as an author.

This second level included reporting on the Nevada Constitutional Convention. Clemens wrote a significant amount during this time, contributing to political dispatches due Monday through Friday, and writing weekly summaries on Sundays. The daily dispatches were published either without a byline or under the name Sam Clemens. They were detailed, formal accounts of the day's proceedings. The weekly reports for Sundays were more in the form of letters. They were humorous, exaggerated, and signed "Mark Twain." This habit shows that Clemens was consciously aware of the separate persona. Mark Twain was becoming the creator of humor and exaggeration.

During this time, Clemens's writing ability improved as a result of the significant amount of writing that his job now entailed. The character and content of his work also benefited from his personal experiences, which included hanging out with politicians, attorneys, and preachers.

Another important event for Sam Clemens during these four months was the arrival of Artemus Ward in Virginia City. Ward was a famous humorist of the day, and had a style similar to Clemens's. Meeting Ward inspired Clemens to become more serious about his own storytelling abilities because he thought he could do something similar to Ward's show. Ward also helped Clemens publish some stories in the East.

Scholars and experts on Mark Twain tend to look at his work with the idea that some of his claims are inaccurate or untrue, which may work well for one purpose, but this view doesn't consider the possibility that Twain lived in a separate world—the world enclosing the storyteller and his audience. Clemens



Mark Twain (second from left) and the Third House of the Territorial Legislature in 1863. (*Nevada Historical Society*)

might sit down to write, but then Twain would take over his "pen and murder all the immigrants on the plains if need be and the interests of the paper demanded it.¹⁰ The world of Mark Twain is full of murders, boasts, bawdy speech, and challenges, not to mention the humorous and sensational.

Joe Goodman knew the world of Sam Clemens:

For the rest of his life, Goodman retained a mental picture of Sam reciting some dramatic or moving poem or stanza, his "noble head" thrust back, his blue-gray eyes half-closed, his voice vibrant and soaring with feeling, a lighted cigar held between the fingers of a hand as delicate as a girl's—completely lost in the imagery and rhythm of the lines. These meetings with Goodman revealed a Sam Clemens most of his friends never saw or even suspected was there. The sensitive boy who never forgot the delicate, exotic fragrance of wildflowers on the Missouri prairies, the smell of lichen and rainwashed leaves in the woods, or the dawn chorus of birds-the boy to whom the wail of a spinning-wheel brought such a keen stab of longing it brought tears-had not been left behind.¹¹

And it was Mark Twain who more and more became the reporter, so that if he reported a story in which he was personally involved, it would always be entertaining, even if significantly different from what might have happened to Clemens.

Virginia City: You might rub shoulders with a murderer and a millionaire
The Making of Mark Twain



Virginia City. (Nevada Historical Society)

Brian Scot Hagen

within minutes. Anybody had a chance to get rich or lose everything, all within a day. Everyone smiled. For Clemens, Virginia City was a different world, a place where he could change and take on this whole new identity. Clemens needed Virginia City. It was where Mark Twain was born.

Sam Clemens couldn't stay there forever, though. Destiny took him beyond this mountain island and through a seemingly simple event. But like most things with Clemens, there were two sides to it.

The short version of the story says that Clemens challenged James Laird to a duel and all we know is that Laird refused. Since such a challenge was illegal, Clemens and his friend Steve Gillis left town to avoid trouble.

What happened to Mark Twain, though, was quite a different story. He "tried to offend Laird, hoping Laird would challenge him." When nothing happened, he challenged Laird. Not just once, but again, and again, and again. After all, there was nothing to be lost and through the process he thought himself to be "accumulating a great and valuable reputation at no expense."¹²

Finally, he "over did it." Laird accepted. The story follows that Twain, who "couldn't hit a barn door," duped Laird, who was practicing "over the hill," into thinking that he had shot off a bird's head from thirty yards away. Actually, his friend Gillis was the ace marksman, but Gillis told Laird that it was Twain's doing. Laird sent Twain a note "in his own hand" declining to fight a duel on any terms whatever.¹³

"Now, we found out later that Laird had hit his mark four times out of six, right along. If the duel had come off he would have so filled my skin with bullet holes that it wouldn't have held my principles," Twain said.¹⁴ It was a fitting end to Mark Twain's stay on the Comstock.

Samuel Clemens lived the life of a celebrity through Mark Twain. Clemens "had always been accustomed to feeling ashamed of himself for one thing or another, so there was no novelty for him in the situation."¹⁵ He found a way to avoid these feelings by diverting them through Mark Twain. Twain was not only able to laugh at himself, but he became an expert at making others laugh along with him. Even while boasting, he did so with humor. One of his largest boasts was, at the same time, one of the most humble.

The last quarter of a century of my life has been pretty constantly and faithfully devoted to the study of the human race—that is to say, the study of myself, for in my individual person I am the entire human race compacted together In my contacts with the species I find no one who possesses a quality which I do not possess. The shades of difference between other people and me serve to make variety and prevent monotony, but that is all; broadly speaking, we are all alike; and so by studying myself carefully and comparing myself with other people and noting the divergences, I have been enabled to acquire a knowledge of the human race which I perceive is more accurate and more comprehensive than that which has been acquired and revealed by any other member of our species.¹⁶

Although Samuel Clemens was a very good writer and led an eventful life,

this was not enough; as himself, he didn't have the guts, that he would later gain as Mark Twain. Mark Twain was the genius. He used everything Clemens had, in the manner necessary, to become immensely successful and widely popular. He was the one who put the American soul into a book.

Mark Twain served Samuel Clemens in a way similar to that in which he serves us. He stands at our level, neither better nor worse, and shares our experiences with us, alleviates our shame, stands up for us, entertains us, and inspires us with faith in ourselves and in something better at the end of the river or trail. It all began in Virginia.



H. W. Laird's father's ranch at Paloise River. (Nevada Historical Society)



Mark Twain. (Nevada Historical Society)

NOTES

¹R. Kent Rasmussen, Mark Twain: A to Z. (New York: Facts on File, 1995), Chronology.
²Charles Neider, ed. The Autobiography of Mark Twain (New York: Harper and Row, 1959) 91.
³Rasmussen, Mark Twain, Chronology.
⁴Ibid.

⁵Neider, A Biography, 123.

⁶Mark Twain. *The Works of Mark Twain: Roughing It.* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972), 275.

7Ibid, 269.

⁸Ibid, 270.

⁹Edgar Marquess Branch, Michael B. Frank, and Kenneth M. Sanderson, eds. *Mark Twain's Letters* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), I, 263.

¹⁰Twain Works, 270.

¹¹Margaret Sanborn. *Mark Twain: the Bachelor Years: A Biography*. (New York: Doubleday, 1990), 191.

12Neider, Autobiography, 128. 13Ibid. 14Ibid. 15Ibid, 123.

16Ibid, 145.

FROM GREAT BRITAIN TO THE GREAT BASIN Robert Fulstone and Early Carson City

Peter B. Mires

This article examines the life and times of Robert Fulstone (1841-1931), who, as a teenager, came to Carson City with his parents and siblings in 1858 and remained there until his death in 1931. My personal involvement with Mr. Fulstone began in the Summer of 1994 when I was director of the archaeological excavation of his farmstead site, situated off Lompa Lane in Carson City. This work was conducted by Intermountain Research for the Nevada Department of Transportation.¹In addition to digging up more than fifteen thousand historic artifacts from the site, the project staff examined records pertaining to the Fulstone family in both the Nevada Historical Society Library in Reno and the Nevada State Library and Archives in Carson City. I also had the pleasure of meeting several Fulstone descendants who still live in the Carson City area.

Robert Fulstone's biography should prove interesting to anyone with a penchant for Nevada history. He witnessed an enormous span of history—from the 1859 discovery of the Comstock Lode and the "wild and woolly" days of early Nevada described by Mark Twain and others, to the stock market crash of 1929 and the onset of the Great Depression. As far as I know, Robert Fulstone was never bitten by the gold bug. He remained a farmer and business person his entire career.

This article focuses primarily on Robert Fulstone's arrival from England and his early years in Carson City. Specific attention is paid to his nine-year tenure as a farmer in Carson City, and relies on both archival and archaeological evidence. This aspect of his life is particularly interesting because little has been written about the agriculturalists who sustained the early Comstock. And it is evident that he was well rewarded for his efforts.

The immigration of the Fulstone family to the United States in the flush years of the early 1850s, and their eventual participation in the rush west, re-

Peter B. Mires is currently teaching at Sussex Central High School in Georgetown, Delaware. An earlier version of this paper was presented at the Nevada Historical Society's Fourth Biennial Conference on Nevada History in 1995. The author wishes to acknowledge Guy Rocha and Jeffrey Kintop of the Nevada State Library and Archives for taking an interest in his research. He also thanks Patrick Murphy and Norma Jean Hesse, Fulstone descendants, who shared historical and geneological information about their family.



Robert Fulstone. (Nevada Historical Society)

flect the forces of demographic movement then existing at the international level. Social scientists frequently speak of human population movement in terms of "push-pull" factors, and the spatial and temporal parameters of the Fulstone migration is consistent with larger population trends on both sides of the Atlantic.

England, the Fulstones' ancestral home, was, in the second quarter of the nineteenth century, experiencing the world's first population explosion prompted by the industrial revolution. The population of England, especially in the Midlands and London, increased dramatically because of a sudden decrease in the death rate. Despite our conception of mid-nineteenth-century urban/industrial England as Dickensian—a human warren choking with coal smoke and soot—it offered a substantially improved quality of life in terms of health and nutrition; a steady factory job in a town or city meant a reliable income with which to buy food and better access to health care. Proportionally more people lived to reproductive age. The demographic "push" produced by this population explosion was massive emigration; England sent forth its excess to populate and administer the British Empire. Many emigres regarded the youthful, prosperous, and geographically burgeoning United States as a prospective homeland–a definite "pull" factor.

Although economic push-pull factors may have influenced the Fulstone decision to come to the United States, it appears that their conversion to the Mormon faith, and its attendant call for the peopling of the Latter-Day Saints' State of Deseret, provided the primary lure. The family sailed from Liverpool aboard the *Charles Buck* on January 17, 1855, and disembarked at New Orleans two months later. They traveled up the Mississippi River to St. Louis, arriving sometime in March, where they joined a Mormon Emigration Company wagon train bound for Utah Territory. The ten-month odyssey of Henry Fulstone, Sr., his wife Elizabeth, and their two daughters and four sons ended with their arrival at Box Elder, Utah, in October 1855.

According to Fulstone family records, the overland portion of their journey was particularly difficult. Most of their possessions were lost or destroyed in transit. The next two and a half years were spent making a livelihood within the context of the Mormon faith, presumably in some agricultural capacity. In the spring of 1858, the Fulstones left both the Mormon Church and Box Elder, placing all of their material possessions in several wagons, and crossed to the opposite side of the Great Basin. They arrived in Eagle Valley in June and took up residence in the newly platted Carson City that would become the territorial and then state capital. Henry Fulstone, Sr. (1805-97) opened a shoe shop on King Street, and the children eventually dispersed to both Washoe Valley to the north and Carson Valley to the south.²

Henry Fulstone, Jr. and his brother Robert acquired land in the vicinity of the Carson Hot Springs.³ Henry and his wife built a house south of the hot springs while his bachelor brother Robert built his house along McDonald's Toll Road in 1862. After Henry 's wife died in 1868, he moved to Washoe Valley, apparently leaving the operation of the farm in Robert's hands. The 1870 Ormsby County Assessment Rolls lists Robert Fulstone as being liable for taxes on the following property: the SW 1/4 of Section 4, the NW 1/4 of Section 9, the SE 1/4 of the NE 1/4 of Section 5, and the N 1/2 of the SW 1/4 and the W 1/2 of the SE 1/4 of Section 9, amounting to 520 acres (Figure 1). In addition, the county assessed Robert Fulstone for this property: two wagons, three horses, twenty-six cows, twenty head of stock cattle, and eighteen tons of hay.⁴

The precise location of a dairy that Henry, Jr., and Robert operated jointly is unknown, but in all likelihood it was situated near the hot springs. However, significant portions of the southwest quarter of Section 4 and the northwest quarter of Section 9 (near the Fulstone house and designated "Field" on the 1864 General Land Office plat) were apparently devoted to crop production.⁵

When Robert Fulstone built his house along the McDonald's Toll Road in 1862 the Rush to Washoe was on. Only three years earlier, Nevada had been, in Robert Laxalt's words, "simply a place to be gotten through as quickly as possible on the way to golden California."⁶ Then silver was discovered on the slopes of Mount Davidson in 1859, and one of the greatest mining booms in history commenced.⁷ With the boom came a demand for all sorts of agricultural produce. According to Myron Angel's *History of Nevada*, "It was not until the discovery of the rich silver mines of the Comstock Lode that the [agricultural] producing power of any part of the State was tested. When Gold Hill, Virginia City, Dayton, and other towns, sprang into existence with their inevitable extravagant as well as necessary wants, fruits, vegetables, and all kinds of perishable produce, were worth mints of money."⁸ This stimulated agriculture on both sides of the Sierra Nevada range, and it appears that young Robert Fulstone saw an opportunity to turn milk into gold.

Of particular interest to Robert Fulstone's participation in this sector of the economy is the origin and growth of the dairy industry in Nevada. There were only 6,174 dairy cows in all of Nevada in 1870, giving Robert Fulstone almost one half of one percent of this total.⁹ Prior to rapid and efficient refrigerated transport, dairy products were, of necessity, produced near their point of consumption, and Fulstone's dairy was well situated with respect to this market.

From the regional perspective, Carson Valley had established itself as a farming center in the 1850s and became especially noted for its dairy production during the early Comstock era.¹⁰ Butter from Carson Valley not only supplied the Comstock but was also shipped across the Sierra Nevada to California. The village of Sheridan, located approximately four miles southwest of Minden, became a locus of both large and small dairy farms. Dairyman Harrison Berry's herd, for example, was said to exceed a hundred cows.¹¹ This area has continued as Nevada's dairy belt well beyond the Comstock boom. According to the Nevada Writer's Project snapshot of the state in the 1930s, this productive region was singled out for its diversified farming, which included a prosperous



Figure 1. Portion of U.S. General Land Office Surveyor's Plat of Township 15 North, Range 20 East, 1864.

dairy and poultry industry.¹² The Carson Valley is still the site of large dairy operations.

The location of both Robert Fulstone's farm in Carson City and farming in general in the belt between the Truckee Meadows in the north and the Carson Valley to the south is consistent with classical agricultural location theory.¹³ Ever since Johann Heinrich von Thünen developed his model of land rent based on distance to market, economists have recognized the importance of transportation in the spatial ordering of land around population centers. The theoretical configuration of concentric circles proposed by von Thünen in 1826 seems to work well where transportation is both uniformly efficient and relatively slow. Clearly the advent of fast, efficient rail transport and the use of refrigerated cars, cooled initially with ice cut from ponds around Truckee, California, would distort the model. Completion of the Central Pacific Railroad in 1869 and its linkage with the Virginia and Truckee Railroad in 1871, meant that foodstuffs could be imported from California and ranches in eastern Nevada. For most of the duration of Robert Fulstone's occupation of his farm on McDonald's Toll Road, however, competition with rail-borne agricultural products would not have been a factor. The location of the farm, with its valuable yet perishable dairy production, seems consistent with von Thünen's model insofar as it was well situated relative to both the Carson City and Comstock population centers.

Robert Fulstone's house entered the archaeological record on July 11, 1871. According to a newspaper account of the incident, Robert and his younger brother Joe had been working in the field that day.¹⁴ Joe went back to Robert's house around noon to start a fire for lunch and had returned, but when they looked back a short while later, the house was engulfed in flame. The site was never reoccupied. Unfortunately, no picture of Robert Fulstone's house or farm is known to exist.

For fifteen days during August 1994, a team of archaeologists from Intermountain Research of Silver City, Nevada, conducted archaeological field investigations at the site of Robert Fulstone's farmstead. This effort, which was funded by the Nevada Department of Transportation because the site lies squarely in the path of the U.S. 395 Carson City by-pass, resulted in the removal of more than 30 cubic meters of soil, which yielded in excess of fifteen thousand historic artifacts and seventeen thousand animal bones.

With the exception of three old fenceposts, no structural remains of the farm existed above ground. The most noteworthy subsurface discovery was that of the cellar hole which contained a thick burned layer of the collapsed house. This feature also contained kitchen-related items such as pots, pans, plates, bowls, and cutlery. Architectural remains consisted of hundreds of cut nails, chimney bricks, and pieces of window glass. Other objects of interest included currency (1838 and 1852 dimes), buttons, a penknife, and a large grinding stone. All of these objects were processed in the Intermountain Research laboratory and are presently curated with the Nevada State Museum in Carson City.

In addition to locating and excavating the cellar remains, the staff discovered an incredible hand-dug, stone-lined well. This feature was excavated, with the assistance of a backhoe by digging a trench adjacent to the well. In this way, by carefully removing the south wall, investigators gained access to the well contents without risking a cave-in from above. The well eventually proved to be more than twenty-two feet deep. Its contents were mainly small-animal bones (rabbits and skunks, etcetera) and some charred timbers, presumably from Robert Fulstone's house, thrown into the well after the fire. Other features identified during the 1994 excavations include the probable remains of a barn and a shed, as well as a dump for butchered bones.

An architectural conception of the structural features of Robert Fulstone's farmstead is shown in Figure 2. Although there are pitfalls inherent in any reconstruction based on incomplete data, this device is commonly used to flesh out the shreds and patches of archaeological remains in order to convey a sense, albeit imaginary, of the whole.¹⁵ Noted examples of this genre are the numerous representations appearing in *National Geographic Society* publications.¹⁶

The spatial relationships shown in Figure 2 among the toll road, fence, well, house, barn, and shed are drawn to scale. The fenceline is extrapolated from the alignment of three fenceposts identified archaeologically. The well is shown with an above-ground casing and roof both of which probably would have existed because of the need to protect the water supply.

The house is an example of a hall-parlor vernacular type described by Thomas Carter and Peter Goss as "the quintessential Utah house during the second half of the nineteenth century."¹⁷ Dimensions of the house were determined by the known distance, 8 feet between the south wall and a chimney niche found in the cellar. This is consistent with the scale of central-chimney hallparlor houses whose gable ends measure 16 feet. The eave dimension of 30 feet was dictated by illustrated plans of this house type.¹⁸ The precise placement of the house as shown here is based on the niche in the north wall of the cellar hole interpreted as a means of giving structural support to the central chimney, and its orientation conforms to the long axis of the cellar.

The architectural type and size of the barn illustrated here have no basis in archaeological evidence, but the barn placement was determined by the concentration of cultural material in this area and the orientation of a brick alignment. The brick alignment, in fact, was used to position the east wall of the barn and the southernmost brick corresponds to the southeast corner of the illustrated barn. The type of barn depicted is based on the "Western Pioneer" type as described by Eric Sloane.¹⁹

The shed is situated atop a concentration of nails, and the size and orientation of the illustrated structure are consistent with the concentration of nails, window glass, and other cultural material recovered archaeologically from this area of the site.



Figure 2. An architectural conception of the structural features of Robert Fulstone's farmstead.

Based on the analysis of material remains of this site, it is possible to say that Robert Fulstone probably enjoyed a fairly comfortable lifestyle. Many of the items recovered are utilitarian, such as buttons from work clothes, tools, and functional pots and pans—the things one would expect a bachelor farmer to possess. On the other hand, Robert Fulstone also appears to have enjoyed some finer things. Several buttons belonged to more elegant articles of clothing, such as fancy vests and gloves. Lead-crystal drinking glass and decanter fragments, and the remains of a large set of china, indicate that he may have entertained. And, based on analysis of the nearly two thousand bottle-glass fragments, it can be said that he enjoyed wine and champagne, but apparently did not have a taste for hard liquor.

The level of affluence to which the material remains attest is corroborated by an examination of the 1870 Ormsby County Tax Assessment Rolls.²⁰ When the listing of Robert Fulstone's personal property is compared to those of fifty individuals who surround him on the tax rolls, admittedly a crude measure of relative wealth, it can be seen that his personal property is valued at \$2,400 whereas the average value of personal property is valued at only \$747. Expressed differently, it appears that this young man, having arrived in a fledgling Carson City, had become relatively successful. This success was probably due to a combination of his own personal industry and the fact that his business—supplying the Comstock with meat and dairy products—was one for which he was doubtless well rewarded.

The year after the conflagration that destroyed his house, Robert accompanied his brothers to Modoc County, California, but returned to Nevada after a particularly hard and discouraging winter. In 1875, he married Mary McCue in Carson City. About this time he was a member of the Masonic Lodge in Genoa and he owned property on the corner of South King and Thompson streets in Carson City, just one block from his father. Later, around the turn of the century, Robert and Mary are known to have resided in Lovelock, Nevada where Robert either worked for, or was the proprietor of, Young's Hotel.²¹

A few years thereafter, the Fulstones returned to Carson City where they lived out the rest of their lives. Robert died in 1931; he is buried at the Lone Mountain Cemetery, approximately one mile from his 1860s farm, alongside his wife, parents, several siblings, and other family members.²²



Robert and Mary (McCue) Fulstone (date unknown). (*Photo-graph courtesy of Mrs. Norma Jean Hesse.*)

NOTES

¹Intermountain Research, P.O. Drawer A, Silver City, NV 89428.

²James G. Scrugham, Nevada: A Narrative of the Conquest of a Frontier Land, Vol. 3: Nevada Biographies (Chicago: The American Historical Society, 1935), 326.

³In Sections 4 and 9 of Township 15 North, Range 20 East.

⁴Ormsby County Tax Assessment Rolls (1870), 96

⁵U.S. General Land Office, *Plat Map of Township 15 North, Range 20 East, Mt. Diablo Meridian,* filed with Surveyor General's Office, Carson City, Nevada, 1 March 1864.

⁶Robert Laxalt, Nevada: A History (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1977), 36.

⁷Eliot Lord, Comstock Mining and Miners (U.S. Geological Survey, Washington, D.C., 1883).

⁸Myron Angel, History of Nevada (Oakland: Thompson and West, 1881), 132.

⁹Based on data in the *Ninth Census, Vol. III, The Statistics of the Wealth and Industry of the United States* (U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C., 1870).

¹⁰Cedil W. Creel, *History of Nevada Agriculture* (Carson City: State Printing Office, 1964).
¹¹Angel, *History of Nevada*, 382.

¹²Nevada Writers' Project, *The WPA Guide to 1930s Nevada* (Reno: University of Nevada Press. 1991), 64.

¹³Johann Heinrich von Thünen, Von Thünen's Isolated State: An English Edition of Der Isolierte Staat, translated by Carla M. Wartenberg (Elmsford, NY: Pergamon Press, 1966). Also see Anthony R. deSouza and Frederick P. Stutz, *The World Economy* (New York: Macmillan, 1994) for a general economic geography perspective.

¹⁴Carson City, Daily State Register, (12 July 1871), p. 1.

¹⁵Walter W. Taylor, *A Study of Archaeology* (Menasha, Wisconsin: Memoir Series of the American Anthropological Association No. 69, 1948), 33.

¹⁶See Gordon R. Willey and Jeremy A. Sabloff, *A History of American Archaeology* (San Francisco: W.H. Freeman, 1974), 187-88 and National Geographic Society, *Historical Atlas of the United States* (Washington, D.C.: National Geographic Society, 1988), 128, for examples of artistic rendering of archaeologically derived data.

¹⁷Thomas Carter and Peter Goss, *Utah's Historic Architecture*, 1847-1940: A Guide (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1988), 14.

18Ibid., 15.

¹⁹Eric Sloane, An Age of Barns (New York: Funk and Wagnalls Publishing Company, 1967).

²⁰Ormsby County Tax Assessment Rolls (1870), 96.

²¹Fulstone Collection, Nevada Historical Society Library.

²²Carson City, Daily Appeal, (11 August 1931), p. 1.

NOTES AND DOCUMENTS A Recently Discovered Comstock Letter of Mark Twain

Lawrence I. Berkove

A recently discovered 1866 letter from Mark Twain to Henry R. Mighels supplies new information on Twain's relationship with the Comstock and its personalities, and may also cast light on the friendship between Mark Twain and Sam Davis, the beginning of which is not currently known. Henry R. Mighels was one of the owners and editors of the *Carson Appeal*, from around 1865 to 1870. He was a respected and influential individual, and Twain's letter to him is a tactful and low-key appeal for support for the projected Carson City lecture of Saturday, November 3, 1866.¹ This letter resembles another, written to Robert M. Howland on the same day, that a little more nervously asks about Twain's prospects of getting a good audience in Silver City and Carson City.² The letter from Twain to Mighels has been kept in the Davis family and passed into the possession of Sylvia Crowell Stoddard, granddaughter of Sam Davis, who generously showed it to me and allowed me to reproduce it.

Samuel Post Davis was one of the most versatile and entertaining writers of the Comstock era. He was born in Branford, Connecticut, in 1850; began his career as a journalist in Nebraska; moved to California in 1872, and to Virginia City, Nevada in 1875. By the time he was twenty-five, he had worked for a Brownsville, Nebraska newspaper, the *Omaha Herald*, the *Lincoln Statesman*, the *St. Louis Republican*, the *Chicago Times*, and several California newspapers. In Virginia City, he worked for Denis McCarthy on the *Evening Chronicle* for four years. He moved to the esteemed *Morning Appeal* of Carson City in 1879, then managed by Nellie Verrill Mighels, widow of its recently deceased editor, Henry Mighels. Within a year, Davis married Mrs. Mighels and became the paper's owner and editor. Under Davis, the paper continued to earn respect for its integrity and its active support of Nevada causes.

The fact that Davis became a warm friend of Twain's is all the more interest-

A noted Twain scholar, who has published several articles and reviews in the *Nevada Historical Society Quarterly*, Lawrence I. Berkove is in the Department of Humanities at the University of Michigan-Dearborn.



Nellie Verrill Mighels, later Mrs. Sam Davis. (Samuel Post Davis Collection)



Sam Davis. (Nevada Historical Society)

ing because their times on the Comstock did not overlap. Twain arrived in Nevada in 1861 and left it permanently in 1864, returning only briefly for lecture tours in 1866 and 1868; Davis did not emigrate to California until 1872, and did not arrive on the Comstock until 1875, but remained there until his death in 1918. Surviving records and correspondence have not so far definitely revealed the occasion of their first meeting.

There is a possibility that the men met in Chicago during Twain's visit there on a lecture tour in December 1871, when Davis was working as a reporter for the *Chicago Times*. A *Chicago Post* article of December 19 reports that on the evening of December 18," a few of the journalists of the city were pleasantly entertained at the residence of Dr. Jackson, a gentleman whom Twain immortalized in 'The Innocents Abroad.'" There is a reasonable possibility that Davis, who already had a reputation as a humorist, might have been one of those journalists. An admiring December 19 *Chicago Times* review of Twain's lecture the night before might have been written by Davis. On December 20, a brief *Times* notice reports that Twain, preparing to leave for the East later that day, "looked in upon several old and a few new acquaintances on yesterday."⁴ If written by Davis, the notice raises the possibility that he might have been one of the new acquaintances.

Whether or not Davis met Twain in Chicago, this letter, obviously cherished by Mighels and his family, may be regarded as a possible entrée for Davis into the circle of Twain's friends. Davis could have made use of it to renew their Chicago acquaintance, if such existed, or to open acquaintance. Davis clearly admired Twain. The two men had reasons to be congenial: both were journalists and humorists, both were talented speakers and raconteurs, both were men of principle, and both had an abiding interest in the Comstock and had Comstock friends in common. In the absence of more specific information, this letter, together with the 1871 Chicago newspaper notices, suggests the most likely explanation of how Davis connected with Twain.

How well Twain knew Mighels is also not presently known. Until this letter came to light, there was no reason to assume that Twain knew Mighels at all. Mighels did not arrive in Nevada until 1865, at least a year after Twain had left it. But since Twain continued to write for the Virginia City *Territorial Enterprise* after he departed for California, Mighels would have known of him, had friends and colleagues in common with him, and, if he visited California while Twain resided there, would almost certainly have met him. The opening address of the letter, "Friend Mighels," and especially the light tone of Twain's ironic use of "preach" to apply to his lecture imply a comfortable and secure relationship with Mighels.

Instead of using conventional stationery, Twain wrote this letter on a strip of printer's galley-proof stock, four inches wide and eighteen long. The narrow format of the letter is reproduced here.



Henry R. Mighels. (Nevada Historical Society)

Va Oct 29.⁵ Friend Mighels—

I am trying to get the theatre for a lecture Wednesday night (day after tomorrow) & if I succeed, I shall preach in Gold Hill Thursday, Silver City Friday perhaps, & Carson Satur day if you think I can get a reasonably good audience. What do you think of it. I ought to get a good house there after all the advertising you have been doing for me-& for which you must accept my warm & grateful thanks.

Yr obliged Serv't Mark Twain

Notes and Documents



Mark Twain. (Samuel Post Davis Collection)

NOTES

¹The exact dates of Mark Twain's 1866 lecture presentations in Nevada, and in Carson City in particular, can be found in *Mark Twain's Letters. Volume 1. 1853-1866*, Edgar Marquess Branch, Michael B. Frank, Kenneth M. Sanderson, eds. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 362–63, nm. 1, 2. This previously unpublished letter by Mark Twain is copyright 1998 by the Chase Manhattan Private Bank as Trustee of the Mark Twain Foundation, which reserves all reproduction or dramatic rights in every medium. It is published here with the permission of the University of California Press and Robert Hirst, general editor of the Mark Twain Project. I wish to express my gratitude to Robert Hirst for his friendly advice and substantial and valuable assistance in the preparation of this essay.

²Mark Twain's Letters 1, 362. Footnote 1 to this letter explains that Twain's anxiety relates to his concern over being remembered for having slandered the ladies of Carson City in 1864.

³Quoted in *Mark Twain's Letters. Volume 4. 1870-1871*, Victor Fischer and Michael B. Frank, eds. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), 518, n. 5.

4Quoted in Mark Twain's Letters 4, 518-19, n. 5.

5"Va" clearly is an abbreviation for Virginia City. The letter had to have been written in 1866, when Twain briefly returned to Nevada for a lecture tour in late October and early November.

BOOK REVIEWS

Comstock Women: The Making of a Mining Community. Ed. by Ronald M. James and Elizabeth Raymond. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1998, 394 pp.).

Mining has always been considered men's work, but the task of building and maintaining mining communities required the efforts of women as well as men. This is the major thesis of *Comstock Women*, which focuses on the activities of women as workers and community builders in Virginia City from 1860 to 1900. That this idea should be novel and surprising in 1998 is a depressing reminder of how much of western history needs to be reexamined through more gender-balanced eyes than those of the original makers of the Comstock legend, whose fascination with the male rowdiness of the mining boom led them to ignore or stereotype women.

Comstock Women owes its existence to a basic tool of contemporary social history, the decennial census. The book is built upon the computerized database provided by the Nevada Census Project for Storey County, Nevada for 1860, just as the silver of the Comstock Lode was beginning to attract people to Virginia City, to the greatest high of population and mining boom in 1870, to 1880 when the richest ore was mined out and people began to leave and finally to 1900 when Virginia City and the Comstock Lode were depleted and most of the population had moved on. The data from these four censuses, plus a special 1875 census, create the opportunity to study and compare the demographics of a major western mining town more completely than has ever been done before. As editor Elizabeth Raymond points out, the Comstock mining boom created an urban, industrialized community that "dramatically affected the texture of women's lives" (p. 11), making their experience very different from that of women in the traditional rural roles that we still mistakenly consider the dominant western story (at least for women). The editors and authors of this volume use the census data, augmented by other sources, to provide us with the fullest picture we have of nineteenth-century western mining town women. Specific articles in the volume draw on the census to explore such quintessential women's occupations as lodging house keepers, needleworkers, and—of course—prostitution. Three appendices present key census data—age, marital status, occupation, birthplace-in statistical form. Other articles go beyond the census to discuss Irish, Chinese and Paiute women, women of religious orders, women and divorce, among other topics. Two excellent introductory articles and two concluding ones frame the collection, which includes fourteen articles in all. This comprehensive book is one that any serious student of western women's history will want to own.

For all of its comprehensiveness, *Comstock Women* has some drawbacks, some inherent, some avoidable. The inherent drawbacks are the paucity of women's personal accounts and the notorious problems of census classifications for women. The authors do their best to overcome the problems of under-reporting of women's economic activities, the undercount of women of color (Indian and Chinese, in particular) and the inevitable squabbles about numbers of prostitutes. Many authors, however, fail to move beyond good descriptions of census populations (valuable as those are) to allow their subjects to come alive. The main reason for this failure seems to be lack of familiarity with comparable studies elsewhere. For example, an interesting article on Virginia City's milliners, seamstresses and dressmakers acknowledges work on Boston and Denver needleworkers but doesn't fully compare it to show what distinctive aspects of Virginia City life made the lives of its needleworkers different. To use Raymond's term, how *was* the texture of their lives affected?

Two articles do break out of the descriptive mode. Ann Butler's chapter on the Sisters of the Daughters of Charity fairly buzzes with social activism. Almost overnight, the members of the order founded a school, an orphanage, and a hospital and made themselves a vital part of the Virginia City community. Butler's article, a part of a larger study on women religious in the West, doubtless gains from her research on the work of other religious orders in other locales. In any case, she clearly demonstrates the activity and ingenuity that women religious brought to their efforts to improve the lives of the people of Virginia City. Sue Fawn Chung's article on Chinese women makes exceptionally good use of other studies of Chinese women in the West to aid in picking through the sparse census data for Virginia City. The article is distinguished by its explication of Chinese social practices concerning concubinage, which was not the same as prostitution, and by its demonstration that by the 1880s Chinese in Virginia City were struggling in the face of hostile legislation to build a stable immigrant community by the usual method—marriage.

In a concluding essay, Andrea Dailey Taylor surveys literary representations, asserting that "the Comstock has become a place of congealed history"(p.266). One can hope that pioneering volumes such as this, which show us the real lives of real women in the midst of an extraordinary mining boom, will unstick the Comstock legend and help us all to see a more complete and accurate western history.

Susan Armitage Washington State University *America's Historic Trails*. By J. Kinston Pierce with Tom Bodett. (San Francisco: KQED Books, 1997. x + 260 pp., foreword, photographs, illustrations, maps, bibliography, index).

America's Historic Trails is a companion book to the series of the same name featuring Tom Bodett, the writer and National Public Radio personality best known for his voice on Motel 6 commercials—"we'll leave the light on for you." The book is intended as a supplement to guide travelers along the ten historic routes described in the series. The book is organized in rough chronological order, beginning with the oldest of the trails, El Camino Real, the Europeanestablished road in North America between the Spanish colonies of Mexico and Santa Fe. Other chapters cover the Boston Post Road, established as a mail route between Boston and New York, and the Great Wagon Road which ran from Philadelphia south to Augusta, Georgia. Daniel Boone's Wilderness Road through the Cumberland Gap is also featured, as is the infamous Natchez Trace on which Meriwether Lewis met a violent death. The more famous western trails of Mormon pioneers to their Zion and of the '49ers to the California gold fields are represented, and the book ends with the route made famous by the rush to the Klondike in the 1890s. A chapter is devoted to each route, giving an account of places and events relevant to it and including maps, photographs, and illustrations. Separate side-bar sections offer excerpts from letters, journals, and published sources related to the trail under discussion. Each chapter concludes with current travel information, "don't miss" sites along the way, and phone numbers for additional details.

Historically, the book reflects some curious omissions, particularly in its representation of Western history. The Oregon Trail, arguably the best known of the western routes, is not treated separately but is mentioned in both the Mormon and California Trail chapters. Though travel to Oregon was eclipsed in numbers by the rush to California, the trail was important in securing the Northwest for the United States. Another famous route, the Santa Fe Trail, opened trade between the Spanish Southwest and settlers along the Mississippi, eventually creating a settlement of Americans in Texas and establishing the United States claim to territories held by the Spanish.

While the book does acknowledge the native peoples—primarily by admitting that portions of these trails followed routes previously used by Indians it is firmly focused on the movement of Europeans around the American continent. It is based on the American history of westward movement which romanticizes the efforts of white pioneers and omits the stories of native peoples a version of history which is drawing criticism from Western historians for its incompleteness and partiality.

As a travel guide, *America's Historic Trails* may enhance the experience of tourists who are interested in traveling along the historic routes featured in the

Public Broadcasting System series. As history, it is history by Cliff's Notes brief, already digested, and not satisfying to a reader interested in a richer, deeper treatment of the American past.

> Cyd McMullen Great Basin College

The Greatest Nation of the Earth: Republican Economic Policies During the Civil War. By Heather Cox Richardson. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1997, 342 + viii, including notes and index).

Nevada history does not exist in a vacuum. The power of major industries (mining and the railroads) and the plight of minorities are historical issues not only in Nevada, but everywhere. Even legal gambling, once unique to Nevada, has become a national phenomenon. Accordingly, the state's history and historiography have benefitted from studies of Nevada people and trends from the inside out—in their relationship with the larger world, from Senators Francis New lands, Pat McCarran, and Alan Bible to gaming and defense. But the study of Nevada history also profits when the state is examined from the outside in—works on issues seemingly unrelated to Nevada, at least on the surface, but actually highly useful in putting Nevada in a broader national and international perspective.

Heather Richardson's book is just such a work. Nevada historians, especially those teaching and writing about the nineteenth century, will find it exceedingly useful. Originally a dissertation at Harvard, this study examines what Republicans thought and did during the Civil War about economic issues. Richardson's seven chapters provide an overview of the party and an analysis of war bonds, monetary policy, tariffs and taxes, agriculture, the transcontinental railroad, and slavery, all as they related to running a war machine and building a nation and a party.

Economic historians may find it lacking in numbers, and Civil War buffs may bemoan its lack of battles, but historians—including western historians should welcome its facts and analysis. "The Republicans acted on a belief that the United States could become the wealthiest, strongest, and most egalitarian nation on earth. Surprised when they found themselves in such a bloody war, they quickly understood that the war years would both compel and enable them to pass sweeping novel legislation to bring their optimistic vision of the nation's future to life," Richardson argues. "Ultimately, however, these revolutionary efforts crushed their dream under the tumultuous new world of the Gilded Age."

Although Richardson understandably pays little attention to Nevada, what Republicans did affected the state. The railroad, which, "Republicans argued, would help to develop the country's agricultural base and thus create a great commercial nation," transformed Nevada by building cities and providing markets and transportation. Richardson shows how the railroad came to be and suggests how it evolved into the power it became. Her analysis of the Homestead and Morrill acts enhances our understanding of public lands policy—both its intent and its outcome, and still important to Nevada and the West today.

What also makes Richardson's study important to Nevada historians is its conclusion. "Republicans, in their optimism, pride, and self-righteousness, could not see that they had built their new America on a flawed theory that their own laws helped to antiquate," by involving the federal government in national economic life to a far greater degree than ever before, thus creating high expectations that went unfulfilled and contributing to the social unrest—strikes and the populist movement—of the late nineteenth century. If Nevada was part of the Gilded Age—the wealth the Comstock produced for a limited number of pockets and the silverites who glommed onto the Populists suggest that it was—it is important know the events and ideas that propelled Nevada and the nation into that era.

Richardson's study is not for everyone, to be sure. It is very scholarly, and it deals with subjects that make the eyes of many historians, professional and amateur, glaze over. Some historians may dispute her conclusions, or contend that they are neither harsh nor broad enough. But her writing is clear and readable, and she peppers the text with brief profiles and quotations that make the going much easier. Her research is prodigious and her argument sound. *The Greatest Nation* is a welcome addition to the literature of the field, and a vein that many historians, of Nevada and elsewhere, should find well worth mining.

> Michael S. Green Community College of Southern Nevada

On the Home Front. The Cold War Legacy of the Hanford Nuclear Site. By Michele Stenehjem Gerber. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1992, Epilogue, 1997, 334 pages).

The Bison Books edition of Michele Gerber's 1992 history of the Hanford Nuclear Site contains a new eighteen-page epilogue which attempts to bring the story into the 1990s. The post Cold War waste cleanup mission is described briefly and the lawsuits filed by "downwinders" are mentioned. Both subjects merit greater consideration, however, if the epilogue is to be anything more than a cosmetic addition.

Aside from the epilogue, nothing else has been changed; there are no revisions to the original edition. The author, staff historian for a Hanford Department of Energy contractor, maintains her cheery optimism and praise for Hanford's contributions to the free world, despite increasing evidence of pollution and disregard for public health and safety during the operational years of the facility. (See original review in *Nevada Historical Society Quarterly* (Winter 1993), 294-96.) Accordingly, the new epilogue focuses on the burdens placed on the Hanford facility to clean up the waste and to fight the downwinder litigation, without also explaining the tremendous environmental and human costs of the project.

Despite the author's obvious bias, however, the book made a worthwhile contribution to the burgeoning literature on nuclear history when it first came out. Based on previously classified documents, it provided the first in-depth look at the construction, operation, and maintenance of the Hanford site over the last half century. Most of the emphasis and interest in the field had been on weapons testing rather than development, perhaps because the related human interest stories are more dramatic; so until Gerber's work appeared, Hanford had been given short shrift by historians. Even so, her conclusion that the site is a "national asset" which "stands now in huge testimony to the American belief in our ability to subdue and control and engineer nature" (p. 237) is a bit much.

> Constandina Titus University of Nevada, Las Vegas

The Players: The Men Who Made Las Vegas. Edited by Jack E. Sheehan. (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1997, 224 pages including photos and index).

There are more than a fair share of bad books on Las Vegas, but *The Players* is not one of them. It is rather a good beginning in nonfiction to portray the lives of the men who built the casino industry into the local, regional, and national power that it is today.

Jack E. Sheehan, a resident of Las Vegas and author of several books and articles about the city, is the editor of the book that consists of fourteen articles. The lead article by free-lance writer Sergio Lalli chronicles the industry control mechanisms and the influence they have had in purging the gaming industry of its most unsavory elements. It is a well-written and researched piece with key insights into state-regulated capitalism working in close cooperation with industry leaders. Lalli's following article on Cliff Jones documents the lawyer, politician, and investor, turned fixer, but fails to make the case that Jones was a key player in building Las Vegas. John L. Smith, columnist for the Las Vegas Review-Journal, weighs in with three of the best-written articles in the book. Moe Dalitz is given a balanced treatment, and Smith reveals his knowledge and the true meaning of Las Vegas when he refers to those who, "like Dalitz, had traveled to the desert in search of a chance to reinvent themselves." Dalitz may have succeeded, but Benjamin "Bugsy" Siegel surely did not. This, too, is a solid piece of scholarship that has the advantage of being highly entertaining. Smith's final contribution, "Sportsmen's Paradise" is a revealing look at the often mysterious world of bookmaking and the men who set the early lines in Las Vegas.

The longtime, if not the prevailing, image of Las Vegas casino owners is captured by A.D. Hopkins's look at Benny Binion and his Horseshoe Club in the middle of Glitter Gulch. There is precious little to admire in the small-time hoodlum who survived the gangster wars in Dallas, only to make it big in Las Vegas. He opened the Horseshoe in 1951, and except for a brief period, controlled its operation until his death in 1989. Few have mourned his passing he arrived a gangster and kept his reputation until his death. Even so, Hopkins is fair to this boorish figure who catered to "stone gamblers" and the average guy looking for cheap whiskey and good food. Hopkins's second article on Jay Sarno is equally well-written and researched. Sarno was the first to link the gambling table to fantasies of the luxurious life. Caesars Palace was his idea and the Mirage, MGM Grand, and the Excalibur "are all logical extensions of the ideas Sarno pioneered." Sarno certainly lived his dream, blowing several fortunes on the high life before dying in his Caesars suite in 1984.

Jack Sheehan's profile of Sam Boyd is a bit lavish in its praise for the brains behind the highly successful Sam's Town. But it does make an important point,

that hard work counts, and in the case of Sam Boyd, he was tireless in his pursuit of success. The same virtue is extolled in Bill Moody and Hopkins's collaborative article on Jackie Gaughan, owner of the El Cortez and the Plaza Hotel. For Gaughan, the marketing of give-aways, everything from candy for mothers to social security numbers drawings, has proved irresistible to longtime visitors to Fremont Street.

Readers will be particularly interested in the articles on Howard Hughes, Kirk Kerkorian, and Steve Wynn. Sergio Lalli's third contribution, on Hughes, provides the reader with a rich summary of Hughes's career in Las Vegas. Thankfully, Lalli points out that Hughes was wrongly given preferential treatment by industry regulators and, that Hughes neither chased mobsters out of town, nor was he the financial wizard that popular lore has made him out to be. And he did not usher in the era of corporate gaming in Nevada. Dave Palermo, a former reporter who covered Las Vegas, authored a short article on Kerkorian. It is short because Kerkorian doesn't say much, disdains the limelight, and cherishes his privacy. After making a fortune in the aristocrat industry, Kerkorian began in 1955 to invest in Las Vegas properties-Dunes, Flamingo, MGM, and his latest, the MGM Grand Hotel. Although there is little here beyond the public record, not much more can be expected from an interview when the subject prefers to provide as little information as possible. That is hardly the case with Steve Wynn, who continually extols the virtues of Las Vegas. Mark Seal, a Dallas-based writer, captures the essence of the Wynn magic: "We're in the entertainment and recreational business now." The Mirage, Golden Nugget, Treasure Island, and the new Bellagio, reflect Wynn's belief that Las Vegas is a main stream recreational center that also has gambling. This is a balanced and wellwritten article.

Not everyone believes that the Wynn vision is good for Las Vegas. Dave Palermo's second contribution looks at the transformation of Las Vegas from Sin City to Family Center. But are kids, strollers on the Strip, and golf course yuppies the cash cow everyone believes them to be? The figures show a mixed return. For instance, non-gamblers accounted for a decline of 2 percent in revenue from blackjack and craps, and a 4 percent falloff in the play on dollar slots. For many visitors, the city is a nickel and quarter gamble while millionaire players still consider Las Vegas the city of choice and, overall, gaming remains one of the nation's fastest growing industries.

The concluding article, "Cowboys, Crooks, and Corporations: How Popular Literature Has Treated Las Vegas" by University of Nevada, Las Vegas English professor John H. Irsfeld, is a fitting conclusion to this work. Professor Irsfeld explores the relationship between myth and the reality of Las Vegas. The myth has maintained the point and visual high ground, resulting in "we all know that a version of reality virtually becomes the reality when it is successful." Las Vegas, more than any other city, has benefitted and been severely damaged by popular perception. While *The Players* is a valuable contribution to the growing body of scholarship on Las Vegas, it is not without its limits. Many of the authors take pains to point out the philanthropic activities of this elite group, Dalitz, Boyd, and Binion for example. Yet nothing is mentioned about the lack of commitment to civil rights. Benny Binion's joint continued to discriminate against blacks after the Moulin Rouge agreement in 1960 and only changed its whites-only policy when compelled to do so by the 1964 Civil Rights Act. Sam Boyd came to Las Vegas in 1941, and while Mr. Sheehan says he gave back to the city, it would have been nice to know if that included a stand on civil rights and exactly what his business policy was on discrimination against African-Americans. Until 1960 Las Vegas casinos routinely practiced discrimination and those who built the early edifices of gaming also supplied the bricks and mortar to maintain white supremacy as well.

> Gary E. Elliott Community College of Southern Nevada

NEVADA HISTORICAL SOCIETY



DEPARTMENT OF MUSEUMS, LIBRARY AND ARTS Joan Kerschner, *Director*

DIVISION OF MUSEUMS AND HISTORY Scott Miller, *Administrator*

ADMINISTRATION

Peter L. Bandurraga, *Director* Lee P. Brumbaugh, *Curator of Photography* Phillip I. Earl, *Curator of History* Eric N. Moody, *Curator of Manuscripts* Lee Mortensen, *Librarian*

BOARD OF MUSEUMS AND HISTORY

I. R. Ashleman, *Reno* Diane M. Deming, *Reno* Renee Diamond, *Las Vegas* Doris Dwyer, *Fallon* Fritsi Ericson, *Reno* Morris Gallagher, *Elko* Donald Hardesty, *Reno* Janice Pine, *Reno* Kevin Rafferty, *Las Vegas* Joseph P. Thornton, *Las Vegas*

Founded in 1904, the Nevada Historical Society seeks to advance the study of the heritage of Nevada. The Society publishes scholarly studies, indexes, guidebooks, bibliographies, and the *Nevada Historical Society Quarterly*; it collects manuscripts, rare books, artifacts, historical photographs and maps, and makes its collections available for research; it maintains a museum at its Reno facility; and it is engaged in the development and publication of educational materials for use in the public schools.